#### CARIBBEAN DEVELOPMENT BANK



# CONDUCTING BASELINE STUDIES FOR SEVENTEEN VULNERABLE AND VOLATILE COMMUNITIES TO SUPPORT THE GOVERNMENT OF JAMAICA'S COMMUNITY RENEWAL PROGRAMME

This Document is being made publicly available in accordance with the Bank's Information Disclosure Policy. The Bank does not accept responsibility for the accuracy or completeness of the Document.

Considered at the Two Hundred and Seventieth Meeting of the Board of Directors held in Saint Vincent and the Grenadines on March 9, 2016.

Division Chief	Ms. Deidre Clarendon
Social Sector Division	
Portfolio Manager	Mr. Stephen Sandiford
Social Sector Division	ı

#### **MARCH 2016**



#### CARIBBEAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

# TWO HUNDRED AND SEVENTIETH MEETING OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS TO BE HELD IN SAINT VINCENT AND THE GRENADINES MARCH 9, 2016

**PAPER 29/16** 

# CONDUCTING BASELINE STUDIES FOR SEVENTEEN VULNERABLE AND VOLATILE COMMUNITIES TO SUPPORT THE GOVERNMENT OF JAMAICA'S COMMUNITY RENEWAL PROGRAMME

#### 1. APPLICATION

- 1.01 By letter dated August 26, 2014, the Government of Jamaica (GOJ) applied to the Caribbean Development Bank (CDB) for a Technical Assistance (TA) grant to undertake baseline studies to support the implementation of the Community Renewal Programme's (CRP) Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) system. This baseline data collection is necessary to establish and support the functionality of the M&E system, which will provide for a more targeted and research-based approach to the design, implementation, and M&E of CRP interventions.
- 1.02 This TA request accords with Goal 2 of Jamaica's National Development Plan (NDP) *Vision 2030: Planning for a Secure and Prosperous Future* <sup>1/</sup> which envisions a Jamaican society that is secure, cohesive and just. This is one of four goals articulated by GOJ to achieve its vision. The project is consistent with CDB's Special Development Fund 8 (SDF 8) objective of improving citizen security and poverty reduction through support for Human Resource Development. It is also consistent with CDB's:
  - (a) strategic objective of supporting inclusive and sustainable growth and development;
  - (b) corporate objectives of improving the quality of and access to education and training and citizen security; and
  - (c) cross-cutting theme of gender equality and regional cooperation and integration.

#### 2. <u>BACKGROUND</u>

2.01 Crime and insecurity have had deleterious effects in many vulnerable and volatile communities across Jamaica. The situation in these communities is often times referred to as "powder kegs" that have the potential to produce adverse shocks to the economy and society resulting in damage or losses which

The NDP was prepared by the Planning Institute of Jamaica (PIOJ) with wide stakeholder inputs during the period 2009-10. Vision 2030 represents a paradigm shift in development thinking in Jamaica. It recognises that economic growth, while necessary, is not sufficient to engender sustainable prosperity for the Jamaican people. For this to be achieved, sustained economic growth must be complemented with measures that ensure broad participation in the benefits of growth, and an environment that fosters creation of a society in which citizens feel empowered and secure enough to pursue a high quality of life. It further stated that the key underlying objective of Vision 2030 Jamaica is, "To secure sustained and broad-based improvement in the quality of life of our people by transforming Jamaica into the place of choice to live, work, raise families and do business."

negatively impact key macro socioeconomic variables. In May 2010, GOJ sought to execute a warrant for the arrest and extradition of an infamous community leader based in the community of Tivoli Gardens. Tivoli Gardens is one of six communities in Western Kingston, characterised by high levels of crime and violence and severe poverty. This arrest effort led to civil unrest which included unprecedented levels of violence against law enforcement agents. The civil unrest resulted in the deaths of 76 civilians (74 males and 2 females) and 4 male law enforcement officers while many others were injured during conflicts in and around Western Kingston. CDB's *Citizen Security Discussion Paper (2012)* recognises the urgency with which these issues must be addressed if the Region, including Jamaica, is not to lose the development momentum of the past two decades, or worse, experience an erosion of the socioeconomic gains attained.<sup>2/</sup> Citizen security, and its subset, community security are recognised to be critical elements of this proposed developmental approach to address issues of crime and violence.

2.02 The Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC) Report<sup>3/</sup> estimated that total damage and losses resulting from the civil unrest in Western Kingston [using the ECLAC Damage and Loss Assessment (DaLA) Methodology]<sup>4/</sup> amounted to one hundred and fifty-two million United States dollars (USD152 mn) [thirteen billion Jamaican dollars (JMD13 bn)]. The Report also highlighted the widespread impacts of the event and noted that while Western Kingston was the focus of the event, several other communities were severely affected in terms of livelihoods lost, particularly farmers in rural communities whose sale of goods through Coronation Market<sup>5/</sup> was disrupted. Primary and secondary schools' students, including those taking Caribbean Advanced Proficiency Examinations and the Caribbean Secondary Education Certificate had their education disrupted. Approximately 2,500 children from ages one to four years in the communities of Tivoli Gardens, Denham Town, Fletchers Land and other surrounding communities would have witnessed the events in Western Kingston and were very likely to have been exposed to some degree of psychosocial trauma.

2.03 The sectoral composition of the impact indicated that the productive sectors suffered the bulk of the impact [93 per cent (%)], with tourism suffering most of the losses due largely to business disruption. This had a knock on effect on those working in the sector, particularly poor female household heads who dominate the lower-level paying jobs. Daily paid workers and others in the informal sector were seriously impacted as their loss of income increased the intensity of their struggle to survive. Productivity losses represented 0.9% of the total and stemmed from morbidity and loss of life, while social distancing resulted in loss of labour productivity and well-being. Costs to the health sector were estimated to be USD1 mn. The Report concluded that a people-centred regeneration plan for Western Kingston was a critical element in revitalising the area as a means to strengthen social inclusion, improve life chances, and overall development opportunities for residents in the respective communities.

Discussion Paper on the Role of the Caribbean Development Bank in Enhancing Citizen Security in the Region. Paper presented to the Two Hundred and Fifty-Second Meeting of the Board of Directors on July 18, 2012 at the Bank's Headquarters in Barbados.

Report of the Macroeconomic Effects of the Events in Western Kingston Area, 22nd May to 7th June, 2010. Report prepared by UNECLAC and United Nations Development Programme for GOJ.

The DaLA Methodology bases its assessment on the overall economy of the affected country. It uses the national accounts and statistics of the country Government as baseline data to assess damage and loss. It includes damage as the replacement value of totally or partially destroyed physical assets, and losses in the flows of the economy that arise from the temporary absence of the damaged assets. (<a href="http://home.mywebsearch.com/index.jhtml">http://home.mywebsearch.com/index.jhtml</a>).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>/ Coronation Market is of tremendous economic value to the Jamaican economy.

#### **Crime in Jamaica**

2.04 More than five years after the Western Kingston incident, Jamaica continues to have a high homicide rate. The country, with a homicide rate of 37.7/100,000 and a population of approximately 2.8 mn is placed among the highest (per capita) national homicide rates in the world. Table 2.1 below provides sex disaggregated data on crimes committed in Jamaica in 2014.

TABLE 2.1: CRIMES COMMITTED IN JAMAICA IN 2014

	No. of Victims			
	Ma	Male		ale
Type of Crime	No.	%	No	%
Murder	905	90.0	100	10.0
Shootings	1,424	88.0	194	12.0
Aggravated Assaults	524	78.1	147	21.9
Rapes	0	0	652	100.0
Robberies	1,583	53.5	1,376	46.5
Break-ins	1,361	51.5	1,280	48.5

Adapted from Economic and Social Survey Jamaica (ESSJ), 2014 (Table 24.6, page 24.5).

- 2.05 The Table also shows a marked difference between males and females in the rate of victimisation with respect to three of the more serious crimes namely: murder (90% males), shootings (88% males) and aggravated assaults (78.1% males). This continues a long observed trend in Jamaica. Males were the majority of victims with regard to robberies and break-ins (53.5% and 51.5%), respectively. With respect to rape, the definition under Jamaican law excludes sexual assaults against males so only females were recorded as rape victims in the police statistics. Nonetheless, reports from the JCF suggested that females are by far the majority victims of sexual assaults.
- 2.06 Other data adapted from the ESSJ, 2014 (Table 24.5, p 24.5) indicate that approximately 98% of persons charged for murder and 99% of those charged for shootings were males. With respect to age, just over 51% of persons charged for murder were under 25 years of age while over 87% were under 35 years of age (Ibid.:24.5). All of the females charged (100%) were under the age of 35.
- 2.07 At the end of 2014, Jamaica saw a decrease in murders and other violent crimes. However, since January 2015, the murder rate has increased by 23% and stood at 1,016 murders as at October 31, 2015. The Crime Statistics from the JCF for that period also suggested that:
  - (a) murders in Kingston, St. Andrew and St. Catherine were down by 1%, while murders in all other parishes were up by 50%;
  - (b) the top 5 parishes in terms of murder per 100,000 inhabitants, in order were: Kingston, St. James, Hanover, Westmoreland and Clarendon;
  - (c) 3.4 persons were murdered a day, on average, up to October 24, 2015, up from 2.8 persons over the same period in the previous year, and 3.3 persons in 2013; and

<sup>6/</sup> Crime Statistics from the Jamaica Constabulary Force (JCF) for the period January to October 31, 2015.

(d) total number of violent crimes was 19 per day in 2015, down from 22 in 2014 and 25 in 2013.

#### **The Community Renewal Programme**

2.08 In critically examining the risk factors associated with the incidents in Western Kingston, and the growing crime situation in Jamaica, GOJ has sought to develop a multi-sectoral approach to rejuvenate and further develop the most vulnerable and volatile communities in Jamaica. Additionally, GOJ intends to use this approach to support the reintegration of marginalised citizens in these communities into mainstream society. It was within this context that CRP<sup>7/</sup> was established in 2011 as a holistic programme of intervention for long-term stability, well-being and inclusiveness, consistent with the goals of Vision 2030 Jamaica (see Appendix 1 for details of CRP). At the policy level, the intervention acts as a global strategic framework aimed at rationalising strategies and social interventions in favour of vulnerable and volatile communities. The CRP relies on renewed strong political commitment, clear objectives, and committed stakeholders for its success. At the operational level, CRP is a platform for coordinating and enhancing the delivery of services in the 100 most volatile and vulnerable communities in five parishes (Kingston, St. Andrew, St. Catherine, Clarendon and St. James). On average, these parishes have sustained the highest murder rates over the last ten years.<sup>8/</sup>

#### **Institutional Arrangement**

- 2.09 The CRP is being coordinated by a Secretariat under the aegis of PIOJ. The approved staff complement of the Secretariat includes a programme director, four programme management specialists, an M&E specialist, a programme associate and a research assistant. At present, five of the positions are filled including the programme director, programme management specialist with oversight for socioeconomic development, programme management specialist with oversight for governance, programme associate, and administrative assistant. There are immediate plans to engage an M&E officer and recruitment efforts have started.
- 2.10 The CRP relies primarily on existing implementing entities and individuals to achieve the desired results in the targeted communities. To ensure the efficient and effective implementation of CRP by the various implementing agencies, the Secretariat carries out its coordinating mandate through the following mechanisms:
  - (a) building partnerships among state and non-state entities;
  - (b) coordination and harmonisation among development partners, state and non-state entities and institutions;
  - (c) resource mobilisation;
  - (d) designing and supporting interventions; and
  - (e) M&E.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7/</sup> http://www.vision2030.gov.jm/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Data extracted from ESSJ (2004-14).

- 2.11 One of the more important interventions of CRP to date is the state-directed pilot programme in the community of Majesty Gardens led by a major housing development sponsored by the National Housing Trust. The CRP brought together an interagency coordinating committee which included a wide cross section of government and non-governmental agencies, international development partners, and representatives of the Majesty Gardens Community Development Committee (CDC). The Social Development Commission (SDC) was a major partner in the development and execution of the CRP's pilot programme in Majesty Gardens. Additionally, the Agency has been the major supplier of community data used for the design and development of community-level interventions through the provision of community profiles and the execution of surveys to assist the process.
- 2.12 The CRP has also provided support to various state-led and international development partner (IDP) ongoing interventions as detailed in Table 2.2 below.

TABLE 2.2: DETAILS OF ONGOING INTERVENTIONS THAT CRP SUPPORTS

Project	Description
The European Union (EU) Poverty	This programme targets 40 CRP communities in support of four of the
Reduction Programme.	six CRP pillars (governance, physical transformation, socioeconomic
	development and youth development). The programme is being
	implemented by the Jamaica Social Investment Fund and is being
	expanded to include 53 CRP communities.
The World Bank's (WB) Integrated	The Integrated Community Development Project to promote public
Community Development Programme.	safety and transformation in 18 communities is located in the parishes of
	Kingston, St. Andrew, St. Catherine, Clarendon, St. Ann, St. James and
	Westmoreland. The programme is funded through a GOJ Loan from WB.
	The project is expected to benefit just over 89,000 beneficiaries with its
	dual focus on the delivery of basic infrastructure and social services.
The Citizen's Security and Justice	Funded by the Canadian Department of Foreign Affairs, Trade and
Programme.	Development [formerly Canadian International Development
	Agency (CIDA)], the programme provides crime and violence prevention
	services to 39 vulnerable and volatile communities, spanning 8 parishes.
	The programme also provides institutional strengthening to the Ministry
	of National Security.
The United States Agency for	This programme targets 25 CRP communities in support of activities that
International Development	cross-cut the pillars of (a) Security and Justice; (b) Socioeconomic
Community Empowerment and	Development; (c) Governance; and (d) Physical Transformation. Cross-
Transformation Programme.	cutting themes within this programme include gender, HIV/AIDS and
	disaster risk reduction. Primary partners are the SDC, the JCF and CRP.

\_

Summary of Information from PIOJ - The Majesty Gardens Pilot targets over 2,739 persons living in 710 households. Of the total targeted beneficiaries, 76% are below 50 years old, with the average age being 39 years. Of the target population, which comprises primarily female-headed households (53.6%), less than half are under 34 years with 91.5% having no academic qualifications. There is poor housing infrastructure, extreme overcrowding with up to 13 persons in a house, poor sanitation, inadequate garbage disposal, and illegal electrical connections for dwellings. To date, the following have been achieved: (a) construction and completion of 48 strata units; (b) reduction of intra-community conflict; (c) implementation of a community literacy programme; (d) business survey completed; (e) CDC established; (f) registration of CDC as a Benevolent Society; (g) provision of Tax Registration Numbers and registration of over 150 residents in the National Insurance Scheme; (h) Majesty Gardens Community Education Development programme established; (i) police youth club established; (j) reduction in community conflict with rival gangs; (k) skills training for youth and certification of Operation Friendship; (l) training of 30 persons in cottage industry skills; and (m) tuition support and employment internship programme established.

2.13 IDPs have developed performance measures (indicators, outputs, and outcomes) for their individual projects. Although CRP provides support to IDPs, the baseline studies are to assist CRP in its coordinating role to monitor the overall outcomes and impacts of the multi-level interventions of the various implementing partners, and provide feedback necessary for developing and implementing future programme interventions. The 17 communities are intended to be the focus of full deployment of the CRP methodology bringing multiple agencies into common spaces with an integrated approach for maximum impact.

#### 3. **ISSUES AND CONSTRAINTS**

3.01 There is one main concern that must be addressed:

#### Lack of Baseline Data to Support the Establishment of a Gender-Sensitive M&E System

3.02 The EU provided support to GOJ to develop an M&E framework and Strategic Plan through a consultancy that was originally scheduled to end on December 31, 2015. It is now expected to be concluded by March 31, 2016. Details of the EU M&E consultancy are outlined in Appendix 2 and one of its main outputs, the draft CRP Results Indicator Framework is at Appendix 3. While valuable, the mere design of the M&E system would not be effective unless provision was made to collect robust baseline data to populate the indicator tables and create the community profiles that would be needed for the design of community interventions and the tweaking of existing programmes. CRP does not have the level of financing to undertake the baseline surveys to collect the required data, including information on the gender-based risk factors influencing crime and violence, nor data on how different demographic groups respond to various social, economic, and cultural barriers in improving their development prospects. Baseline data collection is critical in measuring the results of CRP programmes and in refining those in existence to be more effective. It is expected that this process of data collection would be a pilot for further data gathering among other CRP beneficiary communities, and eventually, all communities within Jamaica. The list of CRP pilot communities is presented at Appendix 4. These run continuously from East Parade in the heart of Downtown Kingston to Riverton City at the most Western end of Kingston.

#### 4. **PROPOSAL**

4.01 It is proposed that CDB provide a grant to GOJ of an amount not exceeding the equivalent of four hundred and forty thousand and seventy United States dollars (USD440,070) from SDF 8 resources programmed for citizen security, to assist in meeting the costs of obtaining consultancy services for conducting baseline studies within 17 of the CRP target communities. Detailed Terms of Reference (TOR) for the baseline data collection consultancy services are provided at Appendix 5.

#### 5. **OBJECTIVE**

5.01 The overall objective of the TA is a gender-sensitive M&E system designed and operationalised to better inform the programming decisions and benchmarks for intended outcomes and impacts of the interventions within the most vulnerable and volatile CRP beneficiary communities. A Design and Monitoring Framework for the project is presented at Appendix 6.

#### 6. **JUSTIFICATION AND BENEFITS**

6.01 The establishment of CRP in Jamaica reflects current orthodoxy in the evolving citizen security discourse which stresses that the response to crime in the Region must go beyond the criminal justice system's attempt to deter crime [United Nations Development Programme, Human Development Report,

(UNDP HRD) 2014:12]. 10/ This Report noted that policymakers are increasingly recognising that preventive programmes can have a positive impact in the reduction of crime and violence. In this context, multi-agency supported community-driven interventions are likely to lead to improved social cohesion and reduce the risk factors that predispose residents in these vulnerable communities to crime. The Report further emphasised the need for evidence-based decision-making in programme formulation and implementation, buttressed by robust M&E systems which will provide the lessons required to replicate results. 11/ The Report by the United Nations Office of Drug Control (UNODC) - 2011 12/ aptly supports this position by stating that there are multiple possible entry points to engage in violence and crime prevention and the common denominator for successful interventions is rooted in evidence-based approaches. This starts with a clear diagnostic of the types of violence and risk factors, and ends with a careful evaluation of the intervention's impact which will inform future actions. In keeping with current good practice, the need to establish gender-sensitive baseline information on target communities is a critical input to achieving the development objectives and outcomes of targeted interventions. Since its inception, the lack of an effective M&E system has resulted in CRP's Secretariat being unable to measure the impact of the multiplicity of initiatives in the target communities and the extent to which the CRP is achieving its stated objectives. The M&E system, inclusive of the necessary baseline data will therefore provide:

- (a) a more scientific basis for sharing information with partners on the impacts of their programmes under implementation, as well as the overall impact of CRP;
- (b) better integration of managing for development results principles in the development agenda of CRP;
- (c) an integrated framework to address some of the most crucial issues including the gendersensitive and social exclusion risk factors that influence crime and violence; and
- (d) robust data that will facilitate formative and summative evaluations of CRP and produce results that can inform and support the replicability and sustainability of interventions in poor and volatile communities.

6.02 The completion of the survey in a relatively short period of time is necessary for comparability of baseline data across the target communities and can be undertaken in the allocated period. This consultancy will benefit from previous instruments that have been developed over time by PIOJ, Statistical Institute of Jamaica, and SDC in conducting surveys of living conditions and community-based research. This project will be undertaking sample surveys and will provide an opportunity to strengthen local capacity in survey design and administration, qualitative and quantitative data collection and analysis, and M&E.

6.03 In the long term, it is expected that the output of the TA will directly impact the lives of over 195,000 people living in the 17 targeted communities, based on SDC's community profiles. With multi-dimensional data available on targeted beneficiaries, all stakeholders will be better positioned to examine the risk factors in the target communities. This will support the development and/or strengthening of appropriate interventions to improve targeted citizen security outcomes for women, men, children, at-risk youth, persons with disabilities and other disadvantaged groups.

<sup>10/</sup> UNDP HDR - Summary Regional Human Development Report 2013-2014: 12 - Citizen Security with a Human Face. http://hdr.undp.org/sites/default/files/citizen\_security\_with\_a\_human\_face\_-executivesummary.pdf

www.unodc.org/documents/data-and-analysis/Caribbean-study-enpdf. Report entitled, Crime, Violence and Development Trends, Coats and Policy Options in the Caribbean.

6.04 This project will provide CDB with an opportunity to develop more targeted evidence-based products and services to support the efforts of CRP. It is envisaged that the results of this intervention will inform large investment projects in similar communities throughout Jamaica. CDB intends to use the lessons learned to better inform its own approaches to citizen security interventions in addition to those in other Borrowing Member Countries (BMC). In keeping with the Bank's focus on promoting regional cooperation and integration, it is intended that the findings of this consultancy will be presented at a regional symposium to be funded by CDB, where challenges, lessons learned, and opportunities for addressing crime and insecurity in the Region will be discussed and further opportunities for CDB's strategic support (including collaboration with development partners) will be strengthened.

#### 7. **EXECUTION**

7.01 GOJ will implement the project through PIOJ, which will be responsible for the management and execution. It shall be a condition precedent to first disbursement of the grant that PIOJ assigns a Project Coordinator (PC), acceptable to CDB, to manage the project. The PC shall be located in PIOJ and shall report to the director of CRP. The PC should have experience and expertise in the management of social research, and practical experience in the use of survey instruments, and community research techniques. The duties and responsibilities of the PC are outlined at Appendix 7. The engagement of the M&E officer is critical to the effective implementation of the M&E system. It will be a condition of the grant that the M&E officer be engaged by September 1, 2016 to *inter alia*, develop and strengthen monitoring, inspection and evaluation procedures, monitor and evaluate overall progress and achievement of results, and monitor the sustainability of the project's results.

7.02 CDB and GOJ will be kept informed of project progress, through the PC, *via* reports submitted by the consultant(s) in accordance with the TOR. It is anticipated that the project will last 17 months. The first Disbursement Date shall be September 1, 2016 and the Terminal Disbursement Date shall be December 31, 2017. The provisional report format for presenting the baseline results is at Appendix 8 and a provisional Implementation Plan is set out at Appendix 9.

#### 8. **COST AND FINANCING**

8.01 The total cost of the project is estimated at USD585,820. The details of the budget are shown at Appendix 10. The financing plan is summarised in Table 8.1, below.

**TABLE 8.1: FINANCING PLAN** 

Financing Source	USD	%
CDB Grant	440,070	75
PIOJ	145,750	25
Total	585,820	100

#### 9. **PROCUREMENT**

9.01 Procurement shall be in accordance with CDB's "Guidelines for the Selection and Engagement of Consultants by Recipients of CDB Financing, published in October 2011". The Procurement Plan is at Appendix 11.

# 10. RISK ASSESSMENT AND MITIGATION

10.01 Some risks have been identified which could have an effect on the implementation and operation of the Project. The risks and accompanying mitigation measures for the project are outlined in Table 10.1.

TABLE 10.1: SUMMARY OF RISKS AND MITIGATION MEASURES

Risk Type	Description	Mitigation Measure
Operational	Limited institutional capacity to carry out the mandate of CRP may lead to slow implementation progress and delay of project outcomes.	The engagement of a dedicated and adequately qualified M&E Officer. It will be a condition of the grant that the M&E Officer is engaged to support the implementation of the system.
	Lack of support and buy-in from communities in the data collection process.	GOJ has a reliable pool of local agencies that has worked in the target communities over the years. These entities have developed effective mechanisms to carry out data collection within these volatile communities. The services for data collection will be sourced from the local pool of agencies which already has experience with the major power brokers/leaders in the communities. This will build trust, provide for greater buy-in and facilitate active participation from the communities.  There is an existing Communication's Strategy which outlines how CRP operates within the target communities. This strategy considers the role of the CDC which comprise all major power brokers within the target communities. To date, this Strategy has worked effectively in facilitating the work of CRP and other partners and will be utilised for the Project.
Implementation	Limited use of baseline data by stakeholders either to inform project design or to make adjustments to projects under implementation.	Improving the functionality of CRP's Inter-Ministerial Committee, National Technical Working Groups and Thematic Working Groups by including participation of other key partners such as Jamaica Social Investment Fund, United States Agency for International Development (USAID), and EU is very likely to increase the demand for, and systematic use of the data.

#### 11. **GENDER**

11.01 The Gender Marker Summary is shown at Table 11.1 below and the Analysis at Appendix 12. The project's Performance Assessment Score is 3.25 or Highly Satisfactory. The Performance Assessment Summary is presented at Appendix 13.

**TABLE 11.1: GENDER MARKER** 

Gender	Analysis	Design	Implementation	M&E	Score	Code
Marker	0.75	1.0	0.5	1.0	3.25	GM <sup>13/</sup>

#### 12. **RECOMMENDATION**

12.01 It is recommended that the Board of Directors of CDB approve a grant to GOJ of an amount not exceeding the equivalent of four hundred and forty thousand and seventy United States dollars (USD440,070) (the Grant) from CDB's SFR to finance the services of consultants to conduct baseline studies within 17 of the CRP target communities (the Project), on CDB's standard terms and conditions and on the following terms and conditions:

#### (1) **<u>Disbursement:</u>**

- (a) Except as CDB may otherwise agree, and subject to sub-paragraph (b) below, payment of the Grant shall be made as follows:
  - (i) an amount not exceeding the equivalent of forty-four thousand United States dollars (USD44,000) shall be paid to GOJ as an advance (the Advance) on account of expenditures in respect of the Project after receipt by CDB of:
    - (aa) a request in writing from GOJ for such funds;
    - (bb) copy of the signed contract between GOJ and the consultant(s); and
    - (cc) evidence that the condition precedent to first disbursement of the Grant set out in sub-paragraph (3) below have been satisfied; and
  - (ii) the balance of the Grant shall be paid periodically after receipt by CDB of an account and documentation, satisfactory to CDB, in support of expenditures incurred by GOJ, with respect to the Project, provided however that CDB shall not be under any obligation to make:
    - (aa) the first such payment under this sub-paragraph until CDB shall have received an account and documentation, satisfactory to CDB,

•

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13/</sup> GM – Gender Mainstreamed: the project has the potential to contribute significantly to gender equality.

in support of expenditures incurred by GOJ with respect to the Advance;

- (bb) any payment until CDB shall have received the requisite number of copies of the reports or other deliverables in form and substance acceptable to CDB, required to be furnished to CDB for the time being by the consultant(s) to GOJ and CDB in accordance with the TOR set out at Appendix 5; and
- (cc) payments exceeding the equivalent of three hundred and ninety-seven thousand United States dollars (USD397,000) of the Grant, until CDB shall have received the requisite number of copies of the final report, in form and substance acceptable to CDB, to be furnished by the consultant(s) in accordance with the TOR set out at Appendix 5 and a certified statement of the expenditures incurred by GOJ in respect of, and in connection with, the Project.
- (b) The first disbursement of the Grant shall be made by September 1, 2016 and the Grant shall be fully disbursed by December 31, 2017 or such later date as CDB may specify in writing.

#### (2) **Procurement:**

Procurement shall be in accordance with the procedures set out and/or referred to in the Grant Agreement or such other procedures as CDB may from time to time specify in writing.

#### (3) <u>Condition Precedent to First Disbursement of the Grant:</u>

The PC referred to in sub-paragraph (4) (c) below shall have been assigned.

#### (4) <u>Other Conditions</u>:

- (a) Except as CDB may otherwise agree, GOJ shall implement the Project through PIOJ.
- (b) GOJ shall, in accordance with the procurement procedures applicable to the Grant, select and engage competent and experienced consultant(s) to provide the consultancy services outlined in the TOR set out at Appendix 5.
- (c) GOJ shall procure that PIOJ assign from within and for the duration of the Project, a PC, with qualifications and experience acceptable to CDB, to manage the project, and to facilitate the work of the consultant(s). The PC shall carry out the duties and functions set out at Appendix 7. The qualifications and experience of any person subsequently appointed to the position of PC shall be acceptable to CDB.
- (d) GOJ shall procure that PIOJ provide suitable office accommodation, communications and other equipment, administrative support and local transportation for the purposes of the Project.

- GOJ shall by September 1, 2016, provide CDB with evidence that an M&E Officer (e) has been engaged to inter alia, develop and strengthen monitoring, inspection and evaluation procedures, monitor and evaluate overall progress and achievement of results, and monitor the sustainability of the project's results.
- (f) Except as CDB may otherwise agree, GOJ shall:
  - (i) meet or cause to be met:
    - the cost of the items designated for financing by GOJ in the budget (aa) set out in Appendix 10;
    - (bb) any amount by which the cost of the Project exceeds the amount set out in the budget; and
    - (cc) the cost of any other items needed for the purpose of, or in connection with, the Project; and
  - (ii) provide all other inputs required for the punctual and efficient carrying out of the Project not being financed by CDB.

#### **SUPPORTING DOCUMENTATION:**

Appendix 1 Details of the Community Renewal Programme

Appendix 2 Detailed Information on the Monitoring and Evaluation Consultancy Supported by

the European Union

Appendix 3 Community Renewal Programme Results Indicator Framework (Draft)

Appendix 4 Phase 1 - List of Community Renewal Programme Communities

Appendix 5 Draft Terms of Reference for Consultancy Services for Baseline Survey to Support

the Monitoring and Evaluation System for the Community Renewal Programme

Appendix 6 Design and Monitoring Framework

Duties and Responsibilities of the Project Coordinator Appendix 7

Appendix 8 Report Format for Baseline Results Appendix 9 Provisional Implementation Plan

Appendix 10 Budget

Procurement Plan Appendix 11 Appendix 12 Gender Marker

Appendix 13 Performance Assessment Summary

#### DETAILS OF THE COMMUNITY RENEWAL PROGRAMME

#### **INTRODUCTION**

- 1.01 Over the last 40 years, Jamaica has faced the seemingly intractable problem of violent crimes with the murder rate in 2009 recorded at 62/100,000 among the top three countries worldwide. While several intervention programmes geared towards violence reduction and enhancing community security and safety have been conceptualised and implemented, the events of May 2010 have provided a clear indication that fundamental and transformative changes are needed to address the entrenched socioeconomic problems which are characteristic of many of the nation's inner-city communities. At the centre of the transformation lies the need for the re-assertion of the legitimate role of the state in these communities. This not only involves re-establishing the primary role of the state in security and justice at the level of communities, but also its important enabling roles in community empowerment and economic and social health.
- 1.02 Jamaica's increasing violent crime rate has resulted, *inter alia*, from the:
  - (a) link between gangs, youth and communities;
  - (b) alignment of gangs and communities with political parties;
  - (c) weakening influence of the state and rule of law;
  - (d) high unemployment rate;
  - (e) inadequate physical and technical capacity of law enforcement agencies; and
  - (f) lack of adequate physical infrastructure in several communities.

#### **Community Renewal Programme**

- 1.03 The CRP has been conceptualised on the premise that security, justice and community economic well-being are pre-requisites for the sustainable development of Jamaica's communities and for the country as a whole. Further, all citizens regardless of socio-economic background must be free to make their own choices, take responsibility for their own actions and be afforded equal opportunities for self-development to make a meaningful contribution to nation building.
- 1.04 The goal of the CRP is to empower residents to achieve their fullest potential and contribute to the attainment of a secure, cohesive and just Jamaican society as outlined in Goals 1 and 2 of Vision 2030 Jamaica. Vision 2030 identifies "gradual intervention in targeted communities that are most vulnerable and among population segments such as young males" (Outcome 5, Security and Safety, p. 106) as a major component of the long- term solution. This is supported by National Strategy 5-1: Strengthen the capacity of communities to participate in creating a safe and secure society. It also corresponds with recommendations contained in the National Security Strategy and Community Safety Strategy and the recommendations of the JCF Strategic Review completed in 2008.
- 1.05 The Programme, which has six components, will not replace the existing initiatives being implemented, but will instead act as a vehicle to promote the harmonised and holistic approach to the implementation of interventions to avoid the sub-optimal use of human and financial resources. It will also seek to deepen the level of intervention to allow for more meaningful impact on communities and attract additional resources to expand the scope of interventions to larger number of communities.

#### **Major Themes**

- 1.06 This draft document is the result of the CRP development process to date. Its major themes are as follows:
  - (a) Enhancing the impact of current violence reduction initiatives through greater coordination and harmonisation of activities at the community level and more strategic deployment of available resources.
  - (b) Scaling up of best practices based on lessons learned.
  - (c) Focusing on longer term sustainability of the programme and a "weaning" of community residents after its conclusion through the transformation of personal and community attributes and assets into productive activity, wealth creation and sustainable livelihoods.
  - (d) Building of trust in the state through deeper, ongoing engagement with communities and a formalisation of community governance to promote legitimate community leadership.

#### **Critical Success Factors**

- 1.07 The CRP will seek to improve on previous initiatives by incorporating a focus on four important aspects:
  - (a) political transformation breaking links between politics and 'dons', gangs and forms of organised crime and other criminal elements;
  - (b) strategic operational engagement by the security forces against criminal elements to complement social and economic interventions;
  - (c) unwavering prioritisation of and commitment to the programme by State and societal action with clearly designated political champions and strong Parliamentary oversight for accountability; and
  - (d) steadfast linking of community outcomes with the economic, social well-being and justice goals outlined in Vision 2030.

#### **Components of the CRP:**

Components	Activities include:
Governance	Strengthening Community Development Committees and other community-based organisations to promote legitimate community leadership.  Policy/Legislative reform to support community governance.  Establishment of linkages between community-based organisations and local authorities.  Promotion of reforms to de-link politics and crime, business and crime, and police and crime.
Social Transformation	Social marketing/messaging campaigns. Coordination of psycho-social interventions. Expanded social work programmes.
Safety and Justice	Establishment of effective police presence/community policing.  Police station upgrades and re-modelling.  Dismantling of gangs.  Support for establishment of community peace and justice centres.  Re-integration programme for ex-offenders and criminal deportees.  Situational crime prevention measures.
Sustainable Physical Development	Improved access to and from communities, infrastructural improvements.  Provision of utilities and sanitation facilities and other community infrastructure.  Community clean-up and beautification.  Promote the development of recreational spaces, green spaces and gardens.  Improved housing quality and access to housing.
Socioeconomic Development	Improved access to educational, skills and life-skills training.  Promotion of income generating activities at individual and community levels.  Job placement.  Promote wider awareness of existing support services and programmes.
Youth Development	Focused interventions for children and at risk youth.  Skills training coupled with more extensive use of Human Employment and Resource Training (HEART), National Youth Service (NYS), Jamaica Foundation for Lifelong Learning (JFLL).  Mentorship, apprenticeships and job placement programmes.  Establishment of information and homework centres.  Establishment of National Youth Club Movement and promotion of uniformed groups.

## Implementation, Monitoring and Evaluation

1.08 The success of the CRP is predicated on the development of key partnerships among the stakeholders (communities, government, opposition, private sector, civil society and IDPs), as well as the commitment of each stakeholder to the process. Communities should be encouraged and empowered to develop their natural and cultivatable assets into financial and social wealth through ways that are inclusive, democratic, transparent, legal and credible.

- 1.09 The CRP is envisioned as a ten-year programme to be supported by shorter term projects of four to five years duration. Timely reviews will be undertaken for each period, which will allow a recalibration of strategies when necessary. Oversight of programme implementation is to be carried out by a Technical Working Committee comprising representatives of Government, communities, private sector, civil society and political parties.
- 1.10 A dedicated management team which enjoys bipartisan endorsement will be vested with the authority and mandate to execute activities and deliver programme outputs within agreed timelines. This team will be responsible for day-to-day coordination with all related projects as well as building partnerships, assessing resource availability and measuring progress. The SDC will over time assume full responsibility for the coordination of the CRP. This approach will be adopted to ensure that the implementation apparatus is sustainable and does not end with the programme.
- 1.11 A framework for data collection and analysis for ongoing monitoring of the programme will be established as part of a wider M&E system. In this regard, it is proposed that a National Crime Observatory be established with the capacity to gather and store relevant data and conduct periodic surveys, including victimisation studies (augmented by questions on attitudes and cultural norms). The M&E framework will also support indicators under the Vision 2030 Medium Term Framework. It is also recommended that the business community establish a monitoring and review mechanism to gauge the quality of business penetration in community renewal.
- 1.12 The prioritisation of the programme by State and societal action with clearly designated political and civil society champions and strong Parliamentary oversight for accountability will be a feature of the implementation of the CRP. The Honourable Prime Minister will be provided with reports through the Permanent Secretary in the Office of the Prime Minister. Parliamentary oversight will also be provided at the level of a Joint Select Committee of Parliament.

#### **PRIORITY ACTIONS**

1.13 The CRP will comprise six components, whose combined effect is expected to lead to a decrease in violent crime and an improvement in the quality of life of residents of volatile and vulnerable communities. The sheer reach of the Programme demands that some attempt be made to identify activities which should be given special focus. Based on consultations with community residents, the following have emerged as priority actions:

FIGURE 1: CRP COMPONENTS AND PRIORITY ACTIONS FOR IMPLEMENTATION

Component	Priority Initiatives	Implementation Partners
Governance	Establishing national governance structures to coordinate	Cabinet Office,
	the delivery of services	CRP secretariat,
	Establish Inter-Ministerial Committee, National Technical	Officer of the
	Working Group and Thematic Working Groups.	Prime Minister
	Develop CRP Partnership Agreements with key Ministries,	(OPM) <sup>/</sup>
	Departments and Agencies (MDAs).	

Component	Priority Initiatives	Implementation
Component	Priority Initiatives	Partners ECJ <sup>1</sup> /, CAFFE <sup>2</sup> /,
	Increasing transparency and accountability in governance	JCSC <sup>3/</sup> , NIAF <sup>4/</sup> ,
	Review and update Political Code of Conduct and enshrine  in Legislation.	OCG <sup>5/</sup> , Political
	in legislation.	Parties.
	• Implement recommendations from Electoral Commission	raines.
	regarding campaign financing.  • Establish legislation to prevent the award of state contracts	
	• Establish legislation to prevent the award of state contracts to individuals linked to criminal activities and increase	
	transparency of sub-contracting.	
	<ul> <li>Implement recommendations from the National Advisory</li> </ul>	
	Council on Local Government including, <i>inter alia</i> , the	
	establishment of local Public Accounts Committees and	
	participatory budgeting.	
	<ul> <li>Mainstream across all parishes the provision in the</li> </ul>	
	Portmore Municipal Council Charter that gives the	
	Portmore Citizens' Advisory Council the right to request	
	the local authority to review decisions.	
	Strengthening the community and parish development	ALGA <sup>6</sup> , CRP
	planning and implementation process	Secretariat,
	• Increase participation of citizens and the representativeness	DoLG <sup>7/</sup> ,
	of governance structures.	MNS <sup>8/</sup> , NAPDEC <sup>9/</sup> ,
	Use data effectively to help citizens and MDAs to identify	NCO <sup>10</sup> ′, NLA <sup>11</sup> ′,
	priorities and monitor and evaluate implementation.	SDC <sup>12/</sup> ,
	Target interventions/services to address locally identified	STATIN <sup>13/</sup>
	priorities.	
	• Strengthen development planning capacity of parish	
	councils and PDCs.	
	• Integrate and harmonise community and parish	
	development planning processes, ensuring that crime	
	prevention and community safety issues are mainstreamed	
	within them.	
	Work with MPs to encourage the use of the Constituency	
	Development Fund to address priorities identified through	
	community and parish development plans.	

Electoral Commission of Jamaica

<sup>2/</sup> Citizens Action for Free and Fair Elections

<sup>3/</sup> Jamaica Civil Society Coalition

<sup>4/</sup> National Integrity Action Forum

<sup>5/</sup> Office of the Contractor General

<sup>6/</sup> Association of Local Government Authorities

<sup>7/</sup> Department of Local Government

<sup>8/</sup> Ministry of National Security

<sup>9/</sup> National Association of Parish Development Committees

<sup>10/</sup> National Crime Observatory

<sup>11/</sup> 

National Land Agency Social Development Commission 12/

Statistical Institute of Jamaica

C	D. J. a. J. L. J. J. J. L.	Implementation
Component	Priority Initiatives	Partners
	Harmonise community boundaries and definitions used by	
	MDAs for planning and data gathering purposes.	
	Establish a national address management system.	
	Strengthening legitimate and participatory local governance structures and the relationship between them	ALGA, DOLG, ICCF <sup>14/</sup> ,
	Strengthen the governance capacity of CDCs and other CBOs.	NAPDEC, SDC.
	<ul> <li>Resource PDCs to ensure that they can operationalise their mandate.</li> </ul>	SDC.
	Increase youth participation in CDCs and PDCs.  Support public advection according to price appropriate for the price	
	• Support public education campaign to raise awareness of	
	citizen participation in local governance.	
	Establish Parish coordinating structures to strengthen      All this structure and the structure of the	
	relationships between Parish Councils, MDAs, PDCs and CDCs.	
	Enhance legal framework for operation of local governance	
	structures through the enactment of the Local Governance Act.	
Safety and	Tackling serious crime	BWA <sup>15/</sup> , CSJP <sup>16/</sup> ,
Justice	• Support the development and implementation of JCF anti-	DCS <sup>17/</sup> , ICJS <sup>18/</sup> ,
dustree	gang strategy.	JCF, PMI
	• Strengthen the legal framework to support the JCF anti-	JCI , I WII
	gang strategy.	
	Support alternative pathways out of organised crime.  Table demostis and conden hand wishing a	
	Tackle domestic and gender-based violence.  Separate the published in a print continuous fibrish in the published in the	
	• Support the rehabilitation and reintegration of high-risk	
	offenders including specific vulnerable populations such as	
	repeat youth offenders, gang members and deported	
	persons.	ICE MOL MUIG
	Supporting effective community-based policing	JCF, MOJ, MNS,
	Develop consultative station policing plans.	SDC
	Build capacity of JCF Community Safety and Security	
	Branch (CSSB) to monitor and evaluate the implementation	
	of community-based policing.	
	• Support the implementation of community score cards to	
	increase local accountability for policing.	
	<b>Enhancing evidence-based crime prevention</b>	JCF, JSIF, MNS,
	Strengthen National Crime Observatory.	MoH, Mona
	• Use data on risk factors to help target interventions at key	Informatics, VPA.
	individuals and families.	

<sup>14/</sup> 

<sup>15/</sup> 

<sup>16/</sup> 

<sup>17/</sup> 

Inner-City Community Forum
Bureau of Women's Affairs
Citizen Security and Justice Programme
Department of Correctional Services
Institute for Criminal Justice and Security

		Implementation
Component	Priority Initiatives	Partners
	<ul> <li>Increasing school safety<sup>19/</sup></li> <li>Harmonise the range of projects related to safety and security in schools.</li> </ul>	JCF, MoE <sup>20</sup> /, MNS, MoJ.
	Build the capacity of the school administration to address safety issues in schools.	
	<ul> <li>Increasing access to justice</li> <li>Finalise and implement the National Policy on Restorative Justice.</li> <li>Establish restorative justice centres (as part of Peace and Justice Centres or other civic centres) in target parishes.</li> <li>Establish Child Diversion Parish Committees in target parishes and support the use of diversion programmes.</li> <li>Support the implementation of the National Action Plan for Child Justice 2010-14 and the National Child Diversion Policy.</li> <li>Provide psychosocial interventions to those affected by or involved in violence.</li> </ul>	DCS, DRF, JFJ <sup>21</sup> /,Legal Aid Clinics, MoJ, JFJ, VSU <sup>22</sup> /.
Social Transformation	<ul> <li>Increasing social inclusion and cohesion</li> <li>Develop social marketing campaigns to reduce stigma associated with marginalised communities.</li> <li>Improve customer service of MDAs to citizens of marginalised communities through ensuring the implementation of Citizen Charters and service standards.</li> <li>Increase awareness of rights and access of citizens to social and economic services.</li> <li>Build bridges between neighbouring communities through sports and cultural activities.</li> <li>Strengthen citizen advocacy through expansion of existing youth advocacy networks or similar youth related structures.</li> </ul>	CAB <sup>23</sup> /, HASE <sup>24</sup> /, Insports, JCDC <sup>25</sup> /, MYSC <sup>26</sup> /, NTP <sup>27</sup> /, OPD <sup>28</sup> /, PSOJ <sup>29</sup> /, PSMP <sup>30</sup> /, Roots FM, SDC.

Initiatives to prevent children from dropping out of school and to address the needs of high-risk children are addressed under the youth development pillar; initiatives to develop safe zones in communities which include schools are addressed under the physical development pillar.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20/</sup> Ministry of Education

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup>/ Jamaicans for Justice

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22/</sup> Victim Support Unit

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23/</sup> Citizens Advice Bureau

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24/</sup> Culture Health Arts Sports and Education Fund

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup>/ Jamaica Cultural Development Commission

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Ministry of Youth, Sports and Culture

National Transformation Programme

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup>/ Office of the Public Defender

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29/</sup> Private Sector Organisation of Jamaica

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup>/ Public Sector Modernisation Programme

		Implementation
Component	Priority Initiatives	Partners
	Fostering personal and community empowerment	CHASE, CDA <sup>31/</sup> ,
	• Provide basic registration documentation to citizens (for	DRF <sup>32/</sup> , JCC <sup>33/</sup> ,
	example, TRN, birth certificates).	Fathers Inc,
	• Reinforce the roles and responsibilities of family in	MOH <sup>34/</sup> , MYSC,
	personal and community development.	NPC <sup>35/</sup> , PALS <sup>36/</sup> ,
	• Facilitate empowerment and mentorship programmes to	PMI <sup>37/,</sup> RLMS <sup>38/</sup> ,
	enhance self-agency and responsibility of residents for their	WROC <sup>39/</sup> .
	personal and community development.	
Physical	Upgrading localised structures and formalising informal	CSJP, FFTP <sup>40/</sup> ,
Development	settlements	HAJ <sup>41</sup> , JSIF, local
	Remove zinc fences.	authorities, MWH,
	Improve quality of housing stock.	NEPA, NHT <sup>42/</sup> ,
	Facilitate citizens to acquire titles for land.	NLA, NSWMA <sup>43/</sup> ,
	Enhance solid waste management.	NWA, SDC.
	Facilitate de-densification/relocation.	
	Establishing and enhancing connecting infrastructure	JSIF, JPSCo <sup>44/</sup> ,
	Improve sanitation systems and facilities.	local authorities,
	• Increase the accessibility of communities (remove physical	MWH, National
	barriers to entry, increase street signs, improve condition of	Water
	roads).	Commission,
	Upgrade and regularise utility services.	NSWMA, NWA.
	Developing public spaces	CSJP, JCF, JSIF,
	• Establish safe zones (including parks, community centres,	MYSC, MNS,
	squares, play grounds).	NSWMA, NWA,
	Clean-up and beautification of public spaces.	SDC.
	Upgrade and identify sites for recreational facilities	
	Preserve cultural and heritage sites	
	Establish and enhance community centres as hubs for local	
	service delivery	
	• Introduction of Solar LED lighting in parks, playgrounds	
	and other public spaces.	
Socioeconomic	Improving employability	Aganar, CSJP,
Development	Provide literacy and numeracy skills training	HEART NTA,
	Support life skills training	JBDC, JFLL,

<sup>31/</sup> Child Development Agency

<sup>32/</sup> Dispute Resolution Foundation

Jamaica Council of Churches

<sup>34/</sup> Ministry of Health

<sup>35/</sup> National Parenting Commission

Peace and Love In Schools

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37/</sup> Peace Management Initiative

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup>/ Rise Life Management Services

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39/</sup> Women's Resource and Outreach Centre

<sup>40/</sup> Food For The Poor

<sup>41/</sup> Housing Association of Jamaica

<sup>42/</sup> National Housing Trust

<sup>43/</sup> National Solid Waste Management Agency

<sup>44/</sup> Jamaica Public Service Company

Component	Duiouity Initiativas	Implementation
Component	Priority Initiatives	Partners NXC45/ DLMC
	Provide vocational skills training	NYF <sup>45/</sup> , RLMS, YUTE <sup>46/</sup> .
	Duoviding amplement ampertunities	CSJP, JCC, JEF <sup>47/</sup> ,
	Providing employment opportunities	
	Use infra-structural projects to provide community	JAMPRO, JSIF,
	employment, particularly for at-risk youth.	MIIC <sup>48</sup> , MLSS <sup>49</sup> ,
	Establish partnerships with private sector to provide jobs for	PSOJ.
	participants in training programmes.	50/51/
	Promoting entrepreneurship	DBJ <sup>50/</sup> , JMA <sup>51/</sup>
	Establish business incubators.	JAMPRO, JYBT <sup>52</sup> /,
	• Promote private sector investments in inner-city communities.	MIIC, UTECH <sup>53/</sup> , UWI <sup>54/</sup> .
	Increase access to affordable micro-finance.	
	Provide entrepreneurial training and support.	
Youth	Promoting prioritisation of youth within CRP	ICCF, JCF, JSIF,
Development	interventions	PMI, PSOJ, NYS,
	Enhance youth participation in local governance.	SDC, UWI, YUTE.
	• Support the development of youth-friendly spaces for	
	providing information and social services.	
	• Ensure vulnerable and high-risk youths are key target	
	groups for employability, employment and	
	entrepreneurship initiatives.	
	• Ensure focus on youth in initiatives tackling serious crime	
	prevention and community safety.	
	Supporting programmes for children and youths in need	CDA, CISOCA <sup>55/</sup> ,
	of care and protection	CF <sup>56/</sup> , HTCC <sup>57/</sup> ,
	Establish safe havens and transitional housing.	JASW <sup>58/</sup> , JCC,
	• Support the prevention of child abuse and psychosocial	JCF, MOH,
	support to victims.	OCR <sup>59/</sup> , WFOJ,
	Psychosocial support to youth and their families with	VSU
	mental health problems and mal-adaptive behaviour.	
	Facilitating programmes for prevention of teenage	JASWA, JCC,
	pregnancy and support to teenage parents	MOE, RISE,
	Raise awareness of sexual reproductive health rights and	WFOJ, Women's
	responsibilities.	,

<sup>45/</sup> National Youth Foundation

<sup>46/</sup> Youth Upliftment Through Employment

Jamaica Employers Federation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48/</sup> Ministry of Industry, Investment and Commerce

<sup>49/</sup> Ministry of Labour and Social Security

<sup>50/</sup> Development Bank of Jamaica

<sup>51/</sup> Jamaica Manufacturers Association

<sup>52/</sup> Jamaica Youth Business Trust

<sup>53/</sup> University of Technology

University of the West Indies

<sup>55/</sup> Centre for the Investigation of Sexual Offences and Child Abuse

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56/</sup> Children First

<sup>57/</sup> Hear The Children Cry

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup>/ Jamaica Association of Social Workers

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59/</sup> Office of the Children's Registry

Component	Priority Initiatives	Implementation Partners
	Support to parenting programmes for teenagers.	Media Watch,
	• Support programmes that strengthen the family unit and	WROC.
	parental responsibility.	
	Supporting high-risk youth initiatives	CDA, CSJP, DCS,
	Develop an at-risk youth database.	MOE, NYS, PMI,
	• Prevent children from dropping out of school and	VPA.
	strengthen resiliency of high-risk children and youth.	
	• Supporting the engagement, rehabilitation and	
	empowerment of youth at risk of coming into conflict with	
	the law, and those who are incarcerated.	
	Promotion of youths as assets in the development process	EMC <sup>60</sup> /, NCYD <sup>61</sup> /,
	• Ensure positive images of youth are portrayed in social	NYOJ <sup>62/</sup> , OPM,
	marketing campaigns to address stigmatisation.	SDC.
	• Support community and national awards which highlight	
	the contribution of youth in the community renewal process.	
	• Support initiatives which allow youth to use and showcase	
	their artistic cultural talents while engaged in community	
	outreach.	

Edna Manley College National Centre for Youth Development National Youth orchestra of Jamaica 61/

#### <u>DETAILED INFORMATION ON THE MONITORING AND EVALUATION</u> CONSULTANCY SUPPORTED BY THE EUROPEAN UNION

#### 1. <u>BACKGROUND</u>

1.01 The CRP was established in mid-2011 as a mechanism for designing and coordinating interventions among volatile and vulnerable communities in Jamaica to ensure better targeting and employment of resources among them and to provide a mechanism for evidence-based decision-making that would lead to deeper impacts on the development and transformation of these communities. Since its inception in 2011, the CRP has gained support from major donors and GOJ institutions. However, a common concern among the partners has been about the absence of a robust gender-sensitive M&E system to measure the combined inputs of partners and their impacts on the target communities. This has been viewed as a major limitation on the capacity of the CRP to effectively perform its role. In particular, the EU as a major contributor to the development of CRP target communities was anxious for the development of such a system. Given this background, the EU offered to assist in the development of the system through the provision of a consultancy. Consequently, in May 2015, the EU hired a consultant to assist the CRP in the development of a strategic development plan and a M&E framework that would link the inputs and outputs of implementing partners to the desired outcomes and goal of the CRP.

#### 2. PURPOSE OF CONSULTANCY

- 2.01 Specifically, the objective of the consultancy was to develop an M&E Framework and strategic implementation plan for the CRP, based on planned outcomes of the programme and Vision 2030 Jamaica that would allow for the identification and measurement of outputs, outcomes and impacts at the level of the projects under implementation, which are being supported by development partners, and others working in CRP communities. The requested services of the consultant were to:
  - (a) Conduct a desk review of all relevant documents (including but not limited to CRP documents, documents of all IDPs and other major stakeholders working in CRP communities, Vision 2030 and other related information).
  - (b) Undertake various tasks related to the development of an M&E system for the CRP including but not limited to:
    - (i) building on the existing draft framework as may be necessary, i.e., reviewing and testing the existing draft framework for relevance and adequacy and examining the feasibility of collecting the data that have been identified for use as indicators;
    - (ii) identifying the mechanisms for and frequency of data collection as well as the protocols for data sharing among agencies producing and receiving data;
    - (iii) reviewing the various M&E frameworks of the main IDPs<sup>1/</sup> of the CRP; and if required, engaging partners in a participatory process to ensure alignment of their various M&E systems with the finalised CRP M&E system;
    - (iv) identifying the appropriate mechanisms for storing and receiving as well as sharing data:

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1/</sup> EU, Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA), World Bank (WB) and USAID.

- (v) under the direction of the CRP Director and in close collaboration with the Information Technology (IT) Department of PIOJ, designing the approved M&E system; and
- (vi) assisting in developing formats and processes for reporting to the CRP by implementing partners (which should include quarterly progress reporting, and annual review formats).
- (c) Make recommendation for timing and methodologies for external reviews, evaluations and impact assessments of the CRP.
- (d) Make recommendations for the sustainability of the M&E framework.
- (e) Train relevant stakeholders in the use of the M&E system.
- (f) Facilitate presentation of the M&E system to relevant stakeholders.

#### 3. <u>COMMUNITY RENEWAL PROGRAMME INTERVENTIONS</u>

3.01 The following diagram shows the cycle of CRP Interventions:

#### **CYCLE OF CRP INTERVENTIONS**



#### 4. OUTCOME OF CONSULTANCY

The EU consultancy was advanced by December, 31 2015 (the original date for completion of the consultancy) and the draft Results Indicator Framework for the M&E System has been developed. The draft Framework was presented at a stakeholders' workshop on January 19, 2016. The consultant is in the process of preparing the Final Report by March 31, 2016 which will include the final iteration of the M&E Framework and Strategic Plan. This information will be shared with CRP partners and will form the basis of CRP's work plans. In addition, it is intended that partners will adopt the Framework and Plan as the focus around which to base and measure the impacts of their interventions within CRP communities.





# Government of Jamaica – European Union Cooperation Programme

# **CRP Results Frameworks**

# Results Framework for CRP Strategic Components (Programme Delivery Platform) – Level 1

CRP GOAL: Citizens are empowered to live full and satisfied lives and have transformed their volatile and vulnerable communities into secure, cohesive, just, prosperous and healthy environments			
Expected Results	Indicators	Data Source	
Outcomes (by Component)			
Ultimate Outcome: Renewed Communities	<ol> <li>Overall ranking of CRP communities on the Community Renewal Scale/Community Development Index* (Consultant to come on board to develop)</li> <li>Percentage of households in the community below the poverty line (Poverty map does not compute households)</li> <li>Percentage of population in CRP communities living below the poverty line, disaggregated by age, sex</li> <li>Proportion of population with improved access to basic services (for example, water and sanitation)</li> <li>Recorded crime rates (murder, rape, domestic abuse, child abuse, etc.)</li> <li>Literacy/numeracy rate</li> <li>Percentage of unemployed among CRP communities compared to the national average (Indicators will be reflected in CDI under components)</li> </ol>	Multiple sources: SLC, MLSS, MOE, STATIN, MNS/JCF	
Component 1: Governance			
Intermediate Result 1.1: Communities are capacitated and participating in democratic processes	8. Percentage of population who in the last 12 months had participated in citizens' engagement which includes having:  Attended a community/parish level meeting, public forum or public affairs discussion group  Met with, called or sent a letter to any local counsellor/politician on community matters  Joined a protest or demonstration for improved community service  Signed a petition towards specific aspects community development	SDC Annual Report	

	<ul> <li>Participate in democratic processes (community, local, general elections)</li> </ul>	
	9. Evidence (?) (put bulleted evidence) of CBOs being proactive in trying to solve local problems/ take action for the common good	Survey/Focus Group
	10. Average number of trained community members volunteering time/donating hours residents volunteering in/donating resources towards support of community development initiatives	CBO Activity Reports*
Immediate Result 1.1.1: Strengthened legitimate and participatory local governance	11. Percentage of persons who are *active members of a local community organisation or decision-making body	CRP, SDC, KSAC, NAPDEC, Local Authorities
structures and the relationship between them in CRP communities	12. Percentage of active community groups organisations represented at higher various level tiers of the Participatory Governance Framework. (bullet levels) CDC, PDC, DAC	
	13. Average number of PDCs actively participating at the local Government level on a monthly basis	
Immediate Result 1.1.2: Increased	14. Level of satisfaction with public service delivery (see number 24)	Survey
transparency and accountability in governance	15. Percentage of people who think they have a real say on issues important to them** (does not speak to accountability or transparency)	Survey
Immediate Result 1.1.3: Strengthened community and parish development planning	16. Proportion of community plans integrated into Parish Development Plans that integrate community priorities	NAPDEC
	17. Level of alignment of partner programmes/projects with community priorities	NAPDEC

Component 2: Social Transformation		
Intermediate Result 2.1: Improved social	18. Level of trust between community members,	Survey
inclusion and cohesion	- State actors, non-state actors and neighbouring communities	
	19. Extent to which community members are willing to help their	Survey/Focus Group
	neighbours (can be referenced elsewhere)	1
	20. Extent to which communities coalesce around common social	Focus Group
	activities (sports, music) - The development of community led	
	programmes to promote inclusion and cohesion e.g. parenting	
	support	
Immediate Result 2.1.1: Improved social	21. Percentage of population in CRP communities reporting improved	UFC, CSJP, JCF, PMI, MOH, MLSS,
skills among target populations	knowledge in coping, planning, negotiating, problem-solving,	NPC, FBOs, JSIF/PRP
	conflict resolution, etc. (not sure that these agencies have this	
	reflected in their instruments, or if these programmes are training	
	programmes)	
	22.	
Immediate Result 2.1.2 Reduced inter and	23. Reported incidents of inter and intra community conflict	JCF
intra community conflict	24. Percentage of population in CRP communities reporting increased	Survey
	ability to traverse freely across (invisible) community lines	
<b>Immediate Result 2.1.3</b> Improved quality of	25. Percentage of the population reporting satisfaction with the quality	Survey
service to target population	of service	
Intermediate Result 2.2: Reduced	26. Percentage of population with ability to respond to instances of	Survey
vulnerability	who know what to do and who to turn to in case of	
	abuse/victimisation (we feel that persons know that they should go	
	to the police but for one reason or another they do not)	
	27. Percentage of population reporting use of violence prevention	Survey
	strategies	
Immediate Result 2.2.1: Improved health	28. Immunisation rate? Cases of teenage pregnancies	MOH, STATIN, RGD
practices	29. Percentage of cases of communicable diseases originating in CRP	MOH, STATIN
	communities. No. of residents with knowledge of healthy lifestyle	
7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7	practices	
Immediate Result 2.2.2: Increased parenting	30. Percentage of adults who accept violence as a means of	Survey
skills and practices	discipline/education (Redundant – no one will tell you that they	
	accept violence)	004 004 100004
	31. Percentage of reported incidents of child abuse originating in CRP communities	OCA, CDA and CISOCA
	32. School attendance rate by children from CRP communities No. of	MOE (reason: It will be hard to collect
		this data from MOE. Data will also have
	CRP communities with parent places	
Immediate Result 2.2.3: Reduced intra	<ul><li>33. No. of parents trained in parenting ad disciplinary techniques</li><li>34. Reported incidents of domestic violence, family feuds, <i>etc</i>.</li></ul>	to be collected from schools)  DRF, FPB, JCF, CDA, CISOCA
familial conflict/abuse/violence	originating in CRP communities	DKF, FFB, JCF, CDA, CISOCA
Tanninai Commet adust/Violence	originating in CKF communities	

Component 3: Safety and Justice		
Intermediate Result 3.1: Increased safety and justice within communities	35. Rate of reported select Category 1 (murder, rape, shootings and aggravated assaults) crimes (by type)	MNS/JCF
Immediate Result 3.1.1 Effective community-based policing supported	36. Percentage of residents who report feeling safe walking alone at night in the community/area where they live, disaggregated by	Survey, Community score card
	sex, age  37. Community perception of Police relations (JCF/SDC scorecard (score recorded on index through community scorecard methodology (SDC))	Community score card, Crime observatory
	38. No. of reported cases of police abuses	OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC DEFENDER; UFC/MNS,JCF, MOCA, INDECOM
	39. Level of satisfaction with security measures provided by the police	
	40. Number of emergency and other service providers reporting improved access to communities	UFC/MNS,JCF, FIRE BRIGAIDE
Immediate Result 3.1.2: Increased utilisation of evidence-based approaches to crime and victimisation	41. No. of partners using data from various databases to guide project/programme development/decision-making	CRP, JCO/MNS, JCF
Immediate Result 3.1.3: Increased school safety	42. No. of reported cases/incidences of disruptive behaviours in school	MOE, JCF, Secondary level institutions in CRP communities
·	43. Percentage of children who accept violence against children as the norm/ as acceptable (who will say yes to this – this may not be very useful)	Survey
Immediate Result 3.1.4: Increased access to justice services at the community level	<ul> <li>44. No. of community level justice services</li> <li>45. No. of residents using available community level justice services.</li> <li>Proportion of complainants before the court or reporting to the JCF and/or who are using available community level justice services including conflict resolution</li> </ul>	MOJ, DRF, JCF

Component 4: Physical Transformation		
<b>Intermediate Result 4.1:</b> Improved quality of the natural and built environment	46. Level of satisfaction of residents with their area as a place to live (including: roadways, sidewalks, street lighting, public buildings)  More built than natural reflected	Survey
Immediate Result 4.1.1: Improved access to quality housing in targeted CRP communities	<ul> <li>47. Proportion of residents in CRP community/ies accessing legitimate housing solutions.</li> <li>- residents who are participating in the NHT contribution scheme.</li> </ul>	NHT, STATIN
	48. Housing quality index	KSAC SDC STATIN
	49. Percentage of houses that are compliant with building codes (This one has several issues that we may not be able to address for the life of the project – recommendation to delete)	KSAC
<b>Immediate Result 4.1.2:</b> Reduced informal settlements in targeted CRP communities	50. Percentage of households with security of tenure	MTWH, NHT, NHDC, STATIN
settlements in targeted CKI communities	51. Percentage of population living in informal settlements/squatter dwellings (Same as 47 – please delete)	MTWH, NHT, NHDC, STATIN
Immediate Result 4.1.3: Enhanced connective infrastructure	52. Percentage of dwellings with legal utility connections by type (water and electricity)	NWC, JPSCO, STATIN
Immediate Result 4.1.4: Improved water and sanitation	53. Percentage of household with access to potable water an improved water source/ piped or safe water	NWC, STATIN
	54. Percentage of household with access to toilet facilities	NWC, STATIN
Immediate Result 4.1.5: Healthy public spaces within communities	55. Area of public and green space as a proportion of total community space	Local Authority (If it is an unplanned community LA would not be a good source), Community Mapping
52 to 54 are difficult to measure. 52 not a challenge for planned communities but for	56. Total area (number of buildings) Number of areas covered by abandoned derelict/disused sites	As Above
squatter communities may be a challenge	57. Percentage of population using public spaces/facilities, disaggregated by sex, age, type of space (for example, cultural and recreational)	As Above

	TEVALI ROUKAMME RESULTS INDICATOR FRAMEV	VOICE (BICHTI)
Immediate Result 4.1.6: Increased	58. Reported economic losses resulting from natural disasters in CRP	PIOJ Rapid Assessment
resilience of households and communities to	communities	
respond to natural and manmade hazards and	59. Percentage of population that know what actions to take to prepare	Reports from ODPEM, NEPA, UWI,
climate change	and respond to risks, disaggregated by sex, age	MLGCD, IDPs
	60. Percentage of communities that are implementing risk reduction	As above
	and resilience strategies informed by accepted national	
	frameworks	
	61. Extent to which vulnerable households, communities use	As above
	improved tools, instruments, strategies, activities to respond to	
	hazards & climate Change	
Component 5: Socio-Economic Developmen		
Intermediate Result 5.1: Economic self-	62. Employment rate (disaggregated by age, sex, vulnerable and	MLSS, PIOJ,STATIN
sufficiency among community members	special need groups)	
	63. Unemployment rate (disaggregated by age, sex, vulnerable and	MLSS, PIOJ, STATIN
	special need groups)	
	64. Percentage of CRP households transitioning from PATH or other	MLSS, PIOJ, STATIN
	social protection programmes	
Immediate Result 5.1.1: Improved	65. Percentage of population in CRP communities accessing	Survey, Partner Reports
employability	programmes to increase employment opportunities reporting they	
	are either employed or in further education or training after	
	leaving a skills training programme	
	66. Percentage of individuals completing secondary level education or	MOE , STATIN
	higher	
	67. Percentage of working age population in CRP communities	MLSS (LMIS), STATIN, HEART
	certified/qualified (disaggregated by age, sex)	Trust/NTA, Partner Reports
Immediate Result 5.1.2: Increased	68. Percentage of community members employed post skill training	Partner Reports
employment opportunities	population in CRP communities accessing programmes to increase	
	employment opportunities (disaggregated by age, sex)	
Immediate Result 5.1.3: Entrepreneurship	69. Percentage of locally-owned businesses surviving one year after	Survey
promoted	start up. Number of MSMEs established	
	70. Percentage of locally owned small businesses # of small	As above
	businesses strengthened and/or expanded (can be split)	

Component 6: Children and Youth Development		
Intermediate Result 6.1: Holistic development of children and youth ensured	<ul> <li>71. School attendance rate - OUT this data cannot be collected</li> <li>72. Child poverty rate - OUT</li> <li>73. Number of street children - no data source</li> <li>74. Reported incidents of child abuse - WAS CAPTURED elsewhere</li> <li>75. Child labour rate - OUT</li> <li>76. Percentage of graduates achieving five or more CXC General Proficiency or equivalent at secondary level - hard to track</li> <li>77. Creation/Existence of child friendly spaces</li> <li>78. literacy and Numeracy test results</li> <li>79. No. of residents trained in and knowledgeable about the childcare and protection Acts</li> <li>80. No. of programmes developed for youth and children (sports, etc)</li> </ul>	MOE, MOH, PIOJ, STATIN, MLSS, CISOCA
Immediate Result 6.1.1: Reduced youth involvement in crime	<ul> <li>81. No of homicides and violent crimes in which victims and/or perpetrators are under 18</li> <li>82. Extent to which programmes/projects implemented have managed to engage male youth</li> </ul>	Crime Observatory, JCF, MOCA  Partner Progress Reports
Immediate Result 6.1.2: Increased participation of youth in legitimate governance frameworks and positive development initiatives	83. Percentage of youths actively participating as executives in CDCs or other community governance structures	SDC, NAPDEC, MYC, MLGCD
Immediate Result 6.1.3: Increased support for vulnerable children and youth	See indicators for 2.2.1 & 2.2.2	
Immediate Result 6.1.4: Improved sexual and reproductive health and general health	84. Proportion of youth reporting increased condom use/practicing safe sex (KAPB)	Survey
practices among youth	85. Teen pregnancy rate/Repeat pregnancy rate	MOH, FamPlan, NPC
Immediate Result 6.1.5: Increased employability and access to employment opportunities for youth in CRP communities	See indicators in 5.1.1 – 5.1.3	

OUTPUTS (All Components)			
<b>Outputs 1.1.1a</b> – <b>1.1.3a:</b> Programmes (by	86. No. of programmes implemented, disaggregated by type	Reports from multiple stakeholders	
type) to support the achievement of CRP	87. No. of persons benefiting, disaggregated by age, sex, vulnerable		
Component 1: Governance implemented	group		
Outputs 2.1.1a –2.1.3a; 2.2.2a – 2.2.3a:	88. No. of programmes implemented, disaggregated by type	Reports from multiple stakeholders	
Programmes (by type) to support the	89. No. of persons benefiting, disaggregated by age, sex, vulnerable		
achievement of CRP Component 2: Social	group		
Transformation implemented	90. No. of programmes implemented, disaggregated by type	Reports from multiple stakeholders	
Outputs 3.1.1a – 3.1.4a: Programmes (by	91. No. of persons benefiting, disaggregated by age, sex, vulnerable		
type) to support the achievement of CRP	group		
Component 3: Safety and Justice	92. No. of programmes implemented, disaggregated by type	Reports from multiple stakeholders	
implemented	93. No. of persons benefiting, disaggregated by age, sex, vulnerable		
Outputs 4.1.1a – 4.1.6a: Programmes (by	group		
type) to support the achievement of CRP	94. No. of programmes implemented, disaggregated by type	Reports from multiple stakeholders	
Component 4: Physical Transformation	95. No. of persons benefiting, disaggregated by age, sex, vulnerable		
implemented	group		
Outputs 5.1.1a - 5.1.3a: Programmes (by	96. No. of programmes implemented, disaggregated by type	Reports from multiple stakeholders	
type) to support the achievement of CRP	97. No. of persons benefiting, disaggregated by age, sex, vulnerable		
Component 5: SocioEconomic Development	group		
implemented			
Outputs 6.1.1a - 6.1.5a: Programmes (by			
type) to support the achievement of CRP			
Component 6: Children and Youth			
Development implemented			

Results Framework for Operational (Programme Management, Coordination, Monitoring & Evaluation & Communication) Platform – Level 2

Narrative Summary	Indicators	Data Sources
GOAL Citizens are empowered to live full and satisfied lives and have transformed their volatile and vulnerable communities into secure, cohesive, just, prosperous and healthy environments	See CRP Indicators above for Ultimate Outcome: Renewed Communities	
PURPOSE To provide a platform for coordinating, supporting and monitoring of initiatives that facilitate social transformation and economic development, strengthen governance, improve safety and access to justice in targeted communities	<ol> <li>Functional <sup>1/</sup> oversight mechanism with capacitated secretariat support for advancing evidenced-based community transformation in Jamaica</li> <li>Functional coordinating MIS database for data collection on CRP progress in place</li> <li>Percentage of stakeholders in CRP communities that are operating within the CRP coordinating framework</li> <li>Percentage of population in selected communities directly reached/impacted by CRP supported projects/initiatives</li> <li>Percentage of residents giving a positive assessment of impact/effect of partner activities in their area/community</li> <li>Percentage of communities recording overall improvement on the Community Renewal Index after a prescribed (agreed) period of focused interventions</li> <li>Percentage of planned initiatives in the Strategic Implementation Plan implemented on time</li> </ol>	<ul> <li>CRP Progress/M&amp;E Reports</li> <li>Database Reports</li> </ul>
RESULTS		
Strategic Objective 1: Strengthened partnerships among state and non-state entities for efficient	<ul><li>8. No. of new partnerships developed by type</li><li>9. No. of existing partners implementing initiatives under the six CRP pillars</li></ul>	Signatories to umbrella MOU
programme delivery	<ul> <li>10. Percentage of partner initiatives/projects that are rated as successful in achieving CRP outcomes under the six CRP pillars</li> <li>11. No. of jointly developed project/programme proposals to address specific gaps implemented</li> </ul>	<ul><li>Project reports</li><li>Evaluation reports</li></ul>
	<ul> <li>12. No./Percentage of identified partners not participating under the CRP coordinating platform</li> <li>13. Number/Percentage of identified partners with earmarked funding to implement critical and catalytic interventions</li> </ul>	

 $^{1/}$  Established bodies (especially National Steering Committee) meeting, working and reporting as per TOR

## COMMUNITY RENEWAL PROGRAMME RESULTS INDICATOR FRAMEWORK (DRAFT)

Narrative Summary	Indicators	Data Sources		
		_		
Strategic Objective 2: Improved	14. Level of participation of stakeholders in coordinating mechanism	•	Project reports	
coordination and harmonisation among	established by the CRP	_	D. C. C. C.	
partners' projects/initiatives (incl. IDPs,	15. No. of comprehensive and inclusive mutual reviews of progress/joint	•	Partner meeting reports	
MDAs) to prevent duplication of effort	assessments conducted among partners and CRP			
and improve targeting	16. Proportion of MDAs that integrate CRP strategic outcomes/ Components	•	Community meeting reports	
	in their strategic plans		T 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	
	17. Proportion of IDPs that integrate CRP strategic outcomes/ Components	•	Evaluation/Review reports	
	in their country strategy			
Strategic Objective 3: Resources	18. Value (\$) of resources secured annually to support community	•	Proposals approved and funds	
mobilized to support programme	development/transformation		allocated	
outcomes	19. Proportion of CRP unfunded initiatives under the six pillars financed	•	Signed agreements	
	20. Proportion of development co-operation funding disbursed within the			
	fiscal year within which it was scheduled by providers (IDPs, MDAs,			
	etc)			
Strategic Objective 4: Critical and	21. No. of jointly developed project proposals prepared to address specific	•	Community development plans	
catalytic programmes designed and	gaps		reflecting priority programme	
implemented to close gaps and advance	22. No. of private sector partners contributing expertise in designing			
the transformation of target	programme interventions to address specific challenges faced by	•	Programme reports	
communities	communities			
	23. Percentage of communities whose readiness have been assessed that have	•	Reports detailing spin offs from	
	developed and implemented a plan of action /project proposal to address		catalytic programmes	
	critical gaps			
<b>Strategic Objective 5:</b> Improved M&E	24. Number/per cent organisations/programme units systematically	-	Partner reports	
and reporting of CRP results	monitoring and reporting on (project) performance			
	25. No. of programmes/projects incorporating lessons learned	•	CRP M&E Framework Reports	
	26. No./per cent of projects evaluated			
	27. Level of use by partners of CRP Results Framework to align	•	Database Reports	
	programming (high use, moderate use, low use)			
	28. M&E framework operational		Communication Plan	
	29. Completed results based M&E Plan			
	30. No. of outputs (by type) from the CRP M&E Framework prepared per			
	schedule (researches; studies; policy briefs, <i>etc.</i> )			
	31. No. of evidenced-informed research/studies prepared by the CRP utilised			
	in planning and decision making			
	32. Communication plan in place			
	1			

# PHASE 1: LIST OF COMMUNITY RENEWAL PROGRAMME COMMUNITIES INCLUDED IN THE PROJECT

#### **Communities** 1. Central Downtown Delacree Park 3. Denham Town 4. Fletchers Land 5. Franklin Town Greater Allman Town Greenwich Town 8. Hannah Town 9. Jones Town Majesty Gardens 10. 11. Parade Gardens 12. Rae Town 13. Rose Gardens Seaview gardens Spring Field Gardens 14. 15. Tivoli Gardens 16. 17. Trench Town

#### **DRAFT TERMS OF REFERENCE**

# CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR BASELINE SURVEY TO SUPPORT THE MONITORING AND EVALUATION SYSTEM FOR THE COMMUNITY RENEWAL PROGRAMME - JAMAICA

#### 1. BACKGROUND

1.01 Crime and insecurity have had deleterious effects in many vulnerable and volatile communities across Jamaica. The situation in these communities is often times referred to as "powder kegs" that have the potential to produce adverse shocks to the economy and society resulting in damage or losses which negatively impact key macro socioeconomic variables. In May 2010, Government of Jamaica (GOJ) sought to execute a warrant for the arrest and extradition of a drug kingpin based in the community of Tivoli Gardens. Tivoli Gardens is one of six communities in Western Kingston, characterised by high levels of crime and violence and severe poverty. This arrest effort led to civil unrest which included unprecedented levels of violence against law enforcement agents and establishments. The civil unrest resulted in the deaths of 76 civilians (74 males and 2 females) and 4 male law enforcement officers while many others were injured during conflicts in and around Western Kingston.

2.02 The Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC) Report<sup>1/</sup> estimated that total damage and losses resulting from the civil unrest in Western Kingston [using the ECLAC Damage and Loss Assessment (DaLA) Methodology)<sup>2/</sup> amounted to one hundred and fifty-two million United States dollars (USD152 mn) [thirteen billion Jamaican dollars (JMD13 bn)]. The Report also highlighted the widespread impacts of the event and noted that while Western Kingston was the focus of the event, several other communities were severely affected in terms of livelihoods lost, particularly farmers in rural communities whose sale of goods through Coronation Market<sup>3</sup>/ was disrupted. Primary and secondary schools' students, including those taking Caribbean Advanced Proficiency Examinations and the Caribbean Secondary Education Certificate had their education disrupted. Approximately 2,500 children from ages one to four years in the communities of Tivoli Gardens, Denham Town, Fletchers Land and other surrounding communities would have witnessed the events in Western Kingston and were very likely to have been exposed to some degree of psychosocial trauma.

2.03 The sectoral composition of the impact indicated that the productive sectors suffered the bulk of the impact [93 per cent (%)], with tourism suffering most of the losses due largely to loss of business. This had a knock on effect on those working in the sector, particularly poor female household heads who dominate the lower-level paying jobs. Daily paid workers and others in the informal sector were seriously impacted as their loss of income increased the intensity of their struggle to survive. Productivity losses represented 0.9% of the total and stemmed from morbidity and loss of life, while social distancing resulted in loss of labour productivity and well-being. Costs to the health sector were estimated to be USD1 mn.

Report of the Macroeconomic Effects of the Events in Western Kingston Area, 22nd May to 7th June, 2010.
Report prepared by UNECLAC and United Nations Development Programme for GGOJ.

The DaLA Methodology bases its assessment on the overall economy of the affected country. It uses the national accounts and statistics of the country Government as baseline data to assess damage and loss. It includes damage as the replacement value of totally or partially destroyed physical assets, and losses in the flows of the economy that arise from the temporary absence of the damaged assets. (<a href="http://home.mywebsearch.com/index.jhtml">http://home.mywebsearch.com/index.jhtml</a>).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>/ Coronation Market is of tremendous economic value to the Jamaican economy.

2.04 While the events of May 2010 could be described as anomalous, the damage and losses suffered brought into sharp focus the significant impact of crime and violence on both the Jamaican macro-economy and poor and vulnerable communities in West Kingston. The ECLAC Report recommended that in order to avert recurrence, greater attention must be given to these poor and vulnerable communities. Such communities are usually characterised by youthful populations, low levels of educational attainment, relatively high youth unemployment as a proportion of total unemployment, and a higher than national average female household headship that is largely unemployed. The Report concluded that a people-centred regeneration plan for Western Kingston was a critical element in revitalising the area as a means to strengthen social inclusion, improve life chances, and overall development opportunities for residents in the respective communities.

#### Crime in Jamaica

2.05 More than five years after the Western Kingston incident, Jamaica continues to have a high homicide rate. The country, with a homicide rate of 37.7/100,000 and a population of approximately 2.8 mn is placed among the highest (per capita) national homicide rates in the world. Table 2.1 below provides sex disaggregated data on crimes committed in Jamaica in 2014.

	No. of Victims						
	M	ale	Female				
Type of Crime	No.	%	No	%			
Murder	905	90.0	100	10.0			
Shootings	1,424	88.0	194	12.0			
Aggravated Assaults	524	78.1	147	21.9			
Rapes	0	0	652	100.0			
Robberies	1,583	53.5	1,376	46.5			
Break-ins	1,361	51.5	1,280	48.5			

**TABLE 2.1: CRIMES COMMITTED IN JAMAICA IN 2014** 

Adapted from *Economic and Social Survey Jamaica* (ESSJ), 2014 (Table 24.6, page 24.5).

2.06 The Table also shows a marked difference between males and females in the rate of victimisation with respect to three of the more serious crimes namely: murder (90% males), shootings (88% males) and aggravated assaults (78.1% males). This continues a long observed trend in Jamaica. Males were the majority of victims with regard to robberies and break-ins (53.5% and 51.5%) respectively. With respect to rape, the definition under Jamaican law excludes sexual assaults against males so only females were recorded as rape victims in the police statistics. Nonetheless, reports from the Jamaica Constabulary Force (JCF) suggested that females are by far the majority victims of sexual assaults.

2.07 Other data adapted from the ESSJ, 2014, Table 24.5, p 24.5, indicate that approximately 98% of persons charged for murder and 99% of those charged for shootings were males. With respect to age, just over 51% of persons charged for murder were under 25 years of age while over 87% were under 35 years of age (Ibid.:24.5). All of the females charged (100%) were under the age of 35.

20.8 At the end of 2014, Jamaica saw a decrease in murders and other violent crimes. However, since January 2015, the murder rate has increased by 23% and stood at 1,016 murders as at October 31, 2015. The Crime Statistics from the JCF for that period also suggested that:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>/ Crime Statistics from JCF for the period January to October 31, 2015.

- (a) murders in Kingston, St. Andrew and St. Catherine were down by 1%, while murders in all other parishes were up by 50%;
- (b) the top five parishes in terms of murder per 100,000 inhabitants, in order were: Kingston, St. James, Hanover, Westmoreland and Clarendon;
- (c) 3.4 persons were murdered a day, on average, up to October 24, 2015, up from 2.8 persons over the same period last year and 3.3 persons in 2013; and
- (d) total number of violent crimes was 19 per day in 2015, down from 22 in 2014 and 25 in 2013.

#### **The Community Renewal Programme**

2.09 In critically examining the risk factors associated with the incidences in Western Kingston, and the growing crime situation in Jamaica, GOJ has sought to develop a multi-sectoral approach to rejuvenate and further develop the most vulnerable and volatile communities in Jamaica. Additionally, GOJ intends to use this approach to support the reintegration of marginalised citizens in these communities into mainstream society. It was within this context that the CRP<sup>1/</sup> was established in 2011 as a holistic programme of intervention for long-term stability, well-being and inclusiveness, consistent with the goals of Vision 2030 Jamaica. At the policy level, the intervention acts as a global strategic framework aimed at rationalising strategies and social interventions in favour of vulnerable and volatile communities. The CRP relies on renewed strong political commitment, clear objectives, and committed stakeholders for its success. At the operational level, CRP is a platform for coordinating and enhancing the delivery of services in the 100 most volatile and vulnerable communities in five parishes (Kingston, St. Andrew, St. Catherine, Clarendon and St. James). On average, these parishes have sustained the highest murder rates over the last ten years.<sup>2/</sup>

#### **Institutional Arrangement**

- 2.10 The CRP is being coordinated by a Secretariat under the aegis of PIOJ. The approved staff complement of the Secretariat includes a programme director, four programme management specialists, an M&E specialist, a programme associate and a research assistant. At present, five of the positions are filled including the programme director, programme management specialist with oversight for socioeconomic development, programme management specialist with oversight for governance, programme associate, and administrative assistant. There are immediate plans to engage an M&E officer and recruitment efforts have started.
- 2.11 The CRP relies primarily on existing implementing entities and individuals to achieve the desired results in the targeted communities. To ensure the efficient and effective implementation of CRP by the various implementing agencies, the Secretariat carries out its coordinating mandate through the following mechanisms:
  - (a) building partnerships among state and non-state entities;
  - (b) coordination and harmonisation among development partners, state and non-state entities and institutions;

<sup>1/</sup> http://www.vision2030.gov.jm/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>/ Data extracted from ESSJ (2004-2014).

- (c) resource mobilisation; designing and supporting interventions; and
- (d) M&E.
- 2.12 One of the more important interventions of the CRP to date is the state-directed pilot programme in the community of Majesty Gardens<sup>1/</sup> led by a major housing development sponsored by the National Housing Trust. The CRP brought together an interagency coordinating committee which included a wide cross section of government and non-governmental agencies, international development partners, and representatives of the Majesty Gardens Community Development Committee (CDC). The Social Development Commission (SDC) was a major partner in the development and execution of the CRP's pilot programme in Majesty Gardens. SDC carried out the baseline survey for the CRP pilot communities. Additionally, the Agency has been the major supplier of community data used for the design and development of community-level interventions through the provision of community profiles and the execution of surveys to assist the process.
- 2.13 The CRP has also provided support to various state-led and International Development Partner (IDP) ongoing interventions as detailed in Table 2.2 below.

TABLE 2.2: DETAILS OF ONGOING INTERVENTIONS THAT CRP SUPPORTS

Project	Description
The European Union (EU) Poverty	This programme targets 40 CRP communities in support of four of the six
Reduction Programme.	CRP pillars (governance, physical transformation, socioeconomic
	development and youth development). The programme is being
	implemented by the Jamaica Social Investment Fund and is being expanded
	to include 53 CRP communities.
The World Bank's (WB) Integrated	The Integrated Community Development Project to promote public safety
Community Development	and transformation in 18 communities is located in the parishes of Kingston,
Programme.	St. Andrew, St. Catherine, Clarendon, St. Ann, St. James and
	Westmoreland. The programme is funded through a GOJ Loan from WB.
	The project is expected to benefit just over 89,000 beneficiaries with its dual
	focus on the delivery of basic infrastructure and social services.
The Citizen's Security and Justice	Funded by the Canadian Department of Foreign Affairs, Trade and
Programme.	Development [formerly Canadian International Development
	Agency (CIDA)], the programme provides crime and violence prevention
	services to 39 vulnerable and volatile communities, spanning 8 parishes.
	The programme also provides institutional strengthening to the Ministry of
	National Security.

\_

Summary of Information from PIOJ - The Majesty Gardens Pilot targets over 2,739 persons living in 710 households. Of the total targeted beneficiaries 76% are below 50 years old, with the average age being 39 years. Primarily female-headed households (53.6%), less than half under 34 years; 91.5% have no academic qualifications. There is poor housing infrastructure, extreme overcrowding with up to 13 persons in a house, poor sanitation, inadequate garbage disposal, and illegal electrical connections for dwellings. To date, the following have been achieved: (a) construction and completion of 48 strata units; (b) reduction of intra-community conflict; (c) implementation of a community literacy programme; (d) business survey completed; (e) Community Development Committees (CDC) established; (f) registration of CDC as a Benevolent Society; (g) provision of TRN and NIS to over 150 residents; (h) Majesty Gardens Community Education Development programme established; (i) police youth club established; (j) reduction in community conflict with rival gangs; (k), skills training for youth and certification of Operation Friendship; (l) training of 30 persons in cottage industry skills; and (m) tuition support and employment internship programme established.

Project	Description
The United States Agency for	This programme targets 25 CRP communities in support of activities that
International Development	cross-cut the pillars of (a) Security and Justice; (b) Socioeconomic
Community Empowerment and	Development; (c) Governance; and (d) Physical Transformation. Cross-
Transformation Programme.	cutting themes within this programme include gender, HIV/AIDS and
	disaster risk reduction. Primary partners are the SDC, the JCF and CRP.

#### 3. ISSUES AND CONSTRAINTS

3.01 There is one main concern that must be addressed:

#### Lack of Baseline Data to Support the Establishment of a Gender-Sensitive M&E System

3.02 The EU provided support to develop an M&E framework and Strategic Plan through a consultancy that ended on December 31, 2015. Details of the EU M&E consultancy are outlined in Appendix 2. While valuable, the mere design of the M&E system would not be effective unless provision was made to collect robust baseline data to populate the indicator tables and create the community profiles that would be needed for the design of community interventions and the tweaking of existing programmes. CRP does not have the level of financing to undertake the baseline surveys to collect the required data, including information on the gender-based risk factors influencing crime and violence, nor data on how different demographic groups respond to various social, economic, and cultural barriers in improving their development prospects. Baseline data collection is critical in measuring the results of CRP programmes and in refining those in existence to be more effective. It is expected that this process of data collection would be a pilot for further data gathering among other CRP beneficiary communities, and eventually, all communities within Jamaica. The list of CRP pilot communities is presented at Appendix 3. These run continuously from East Parade in the heart of Downtown Kingston to Riverton City at the most Western end of Kingston.

#### 4. **OBJECTIVE**

4.01 The overall objective of the TA is a gender-sensitive M&E system designed and operationalised to better inform the programming decisions and benchmarks for intended outcomes and impacts of the interventions within the most vulnerable and volatile CRP beneficiary communities.

#### 5. <u>METHODOLOGY</u>

5.01 The consultant(s) will design and conduct surveys, participatory assessments and focus group discussions in 17 of the CRP Phase 1 communities to collect baseline information on these communities. The research will collect primary data, however, relevant secondary information may be used, as necessary. Data to be collected will take into account the indicator Tables and that have been developed under the EU component of the M&E system. The outputs of the EU component will guide the nature of the data to be collected in the baseline studies and will therefore inform the data collection methods. To gather the qualitative and quantitative information/data, the consultant will use a triangulated approach including appropriate participatory methodologies and requisite household survey approaches and methods. While collecting the information from the field, the consultant will pay attention to five livelihood assets namely the physical, social, natural, human and financial aspects. The data collection instruments will be developed through consultations with CRP partners to ensure that the data from these surveys will be used as benchmarks against which to measure the impacts and outcomes of interventions in the target communities by various implementing agencies.

- 5.02 The assignment will include, but is not limited to, development of a survey design, data collection instruments, conducting surveys, developing a database that is compatible with the indicators identified under the EU project, preparing a report and facilitating training of relevant stakeholders in data collection, data entry and analysis to support implementation of the M&E system, a workshop to share the details of the process and the findings, and training of CRP staff and key stakeholders on use of the baseline data.
- 5.03 The consultant(s) will initiate discussions with key stakeholders to determine how their data needs may be met through the surveys that will be conducted.

#### 6. SCOPE OF SERVICES

- 6.01 The consultant/s will review the M&E system proposed for the CRP under EU support to facilitate the design and conduct of surveys in 17 of the CRP Phase 1 communities in Kingston and St. Andrew. The surveys should incorporate the data needs of the proposed M&E system under the CRP programme as far as possible. The consultant/s will be required to undertake the following tasks:
  - (a) review M&E framework reports and proposed indicators emanating from the EU-supported component of the overall system;
  - (b) prepare a Baseline Plan that should include Baseline Focus, Data Collection Methods, Data Source and Quantity, Location of Data Collection, Means of Analysis, and Time Needed.
  - (c) develop/design Baseline Study including questionnaire for household survey, techniques for participatory assessments including community mapping, and checklist for focus group discussions. The survey instrument should capture, but not be limited to sex-disaggregated data of the following:
    - (i) population by age;
    - (ii) settlement patterns and land tenure;
    - (iii) main occupation, employment and the flow of seasonal migration;
    - (iv) number of youth and adolescents out of school;
    - (v) youths, male and female employment rate;
    - (vi) the status of children's education in beneficiary communities;
    - (vii) residents' overall access to market and market information;
    - (viii) risk factors affecting children, women, men and vulnerable groups;
    - (ix) the extent to which the communities are dependent on remittances;
    - (x) existing community-based organisations groups/cooperatives and their institutional capacity;
    - (xi) the accessibility of credit facilities, traditional and non-traditional forms of credit; and

- (xii) the level of community relationships (cohesion and social capital);
- (xiii) debrief/discuss with project team and key stakeholders, the effectiveness of questionnaire, checklists and other tools to be used in pre-test, collect feedback to validate and finalise same:
- (xiv) pre-test the questionnaire and other tools in project. It is anticipated that 200 questionnaires will be pre-tested in order to deliver a 90% confidence level and 5% margin of error, and 8,500 questionnaires utilised in the survey to deliver a 99% confidence level with a 5% margin of error. The aim of the project is to identify needs represented by at least 75% of the target communities;
- (xv) select community mobilisers and orient and supervise enumerators some of whom will be selected from target communities through the Community Development Councils, in each district. Costs related to these activities will be borne by the consultancy firm;
- (xvi) conduct interviews with community-based organisations/non-governmental organisations and private sector entities at the community level;
- (xvii) ensure that high quality data/information is collected from the field, cross check the validity of information collected and verify/revise where needed; provide updates on progress of the study on a weekly basis to Project Manager;
- (xviii) undertake data analysis and report preparation;
- (xix) train CRP staff and relevant stakeholders in the use of the M&E system;
- (xx) present draft report to Project Team; and
- (xxi) submit Final Report of each community as well as a compiled version of the Report to the Team Leader after incorporating the suggestion and feedback of the project team.

#### 7. TIMING AND QUALIFICATIONS

7.01 It is anticipated that the consultancy will require a total of 143 person days over a period of 12 months. A multi-disciplinary team will be required to undertake the assignment. The lead consultant should be an M&E specialist and have at least a Post-graduate Degree in statistical analysis, development studies, social sciences, economics, or other relevant areas with at least eight years' experience in conducting baseline surveys and programme evaluation; having work experience and interaction with key stakeholders in vulnerable and volatile communities, both at the operational and policy levels would be an asset; strong research and analytical skills with special emphasis on data collection and analysis tools; and solid project management and implementation experience. The Team should comprise a gender specialist who should have at least a Master's Degree in gender and development studies, development studies, social sciences, or other relevant subject area with at least five years' experience in conducting and analysing field-level baseline surveys; in addition to a sociologist/social analyst with at least a Master's Degree in sociology, social planning, community development and at least five years' experience in conducting and analysing baseline studies in volatile communities utilising qualitative (including participatory) and quantitative methodologies.

#### 8. REPORTING

8.01 The technical proposal of the selected firm shall have already outlined a work plan and approach to the assignment, the scope and methodology, the tasks and responsibilities of the different team members, and a time schedule for the completion of the assignment. The following reports, one bound copy each, along with an electronic copy either by email or on universal serial bus (USB) flash drive, shall be submitted to the Caribbean Development Bank (CDB), the Planning Institute of Jamaica and GOJ at the times indicated below:

- (a) An Inception Report including survey plan within three weeks of commencement of the assignment.
- (b) First Progress Report after completion of the selection and training of field staff, pretesting of the questionnaire and commencement of the fieldwork (six weeks after the Inception Report). CDB, CRP and GOJ will provide feedback within two weeks of receiving the first Progress Report.
- (c) Second Progress Report on completion of the data collection (12 weeks after the first Progress Report). CDB, CRP and GOJ will provide feedback within two weeks of receiving the second Progress Report.
- (d) Present draft Report at a stakeholder's workshop 15 weeks after the second Progress Report. This Report should be issued to all key stakeholders two weeks prior to the Workshop.
- (e) Draft Final Report 4 weeks after the Stakeholder's workshop, incorporating the outputs required previously and incorporating the feedback received at the Stakeholders' Workshop. CDB, CRP and GOJ will provide feedback upon receipt of the draft Final Report within two weeks of receiving the Draft Final Report.
- (f) Final Report 5 weeks after the Draft Final Report, incorporating all of the outputs required previously. This Report should be presented three weeks after receipt of comments from CDB, CRP and GOJ.

# **DESIGN AND MONITORING FRAMEWORK**

Narrative Summary	Objectively	Verifiable Inc	licators		Means of Verification		Assumptions
1. Goal: Contribute to improved effectiveness of CRP interventions in selected CRP communities in Jamaica.	CRP communities utilising baseline data by December 31, 2018.			3.	Statistics from Police. Statistics from Statistical Institute of Jamaica. Statistics from Social Development Commission. Crime Observatory Statistics.	1. 2.	Sustained political support for CRP's mandate. Stable socio-political environment.
2. Outcome: Enhanced capacity to design, monitor and evaluate programmes and to better inform gender-sensitive and inclusive programming decisions and benchmarks for interventions in CRP communities.	Within one year of the I  1. At least two gende developed from the baseline data to adtarget communities  2. At least five communities projects developed  3. M&E System oper	r-responsive police information gendress the crime and the crime and the crime and the crime are the crime and the crime are the	cy options herated from the and insecurity in the her-sensitive	1. 2. 3.	Direct observation. Project CRP M&E Reports.	1.	Data from M&E system utilised in the work of CRP staff. Fully resourced CRP.
Outputs:     Gender-sensitive socioeconomic baseline database developed.     M&E System established.     Survey Report completed.	<ol> <li>Gender analysis of the baseline data and identification of risk factors in target communities by June 30, 2017.</li> <li>Collection of sex-disaggregated and gender sensitive socioeconomic baseline data completed by September 30, 2017.</li> <li>Gender-sensitive M&amp;E System established by December 31, 2017.</li> <li>Gender-sensitive Survey Report completed by December 31, 2017.</li> </ol>			1. 2. 3. 4. 5. 6.	Reports. Project Completion Reports.	1. 2.	Consultants' reports submitted in a timely manner and accepted by CRP, GOJ and CDB.  Timely recruitment of CRP staff.
4. Inputs:  Consultancy Services Project Management and Administrative Support Stakeholder Consultations Contingencies Total	CDB 400,064 40,006 440,070	(USD) PIOJ  120,500 12,000 13,250 145,750	Total 400,064 120,500 12,000 53,256 585,820		PIOJ and CDB.	2.	GOJ provides counterpart and administrative support. Stakeholders cooperate and participate effectively in the survey and consultation process.
Percentages	75	25	100				

#### **DUTIES AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF THE PROJECT COORDINATOR**

#### PROJECT COORDINATOR

- 1. The PC shall be responsible for coordinating and monitoring all aspects of the implementation of the Project.
- 2. Responsibilities of the PC include, but are not limited to:
  - (a) the day-to-day supervision of the consultants;
  - (b) finalisation of the TORs for all consultancy services to be undertaken in the Project;
  - (c) revising the Results Monitoring Framework, including the collection of baseline data, disaggregated by sex;
  - (d) ensuring the incorporation of gender analysis at appropriate stages of the project's outputs;
  - (e) evaluation of proposals and recommendations of the awards of TA consultancy contracts in view of their overall quality, responsiveness to gender equality and focus on results;
  - (f) cost control;
  - (g) preparation and submission of claims to CDB for disbursement;
  - (h) keeping separate accounts for project-related expenditures and disbursement activities;
  - (i) submission to CDB, within one month after the end of each quarter, gender-responsive progress reports on implementation of the consultancy;
  - (j) preparation and submission to CDB of a Project Completion Report; and
  - (j) undertaking any other duties as may be assigned from time to time.
- 3. The PC should have a minimum of the following qualifications:
  - (a) A Graduate Degree or commensurate qualifications in the Social Sciences or a relevant field with a minimum of five years' experience in the coordination, management and implementation of citizen/community security/crime prevention projects and project management.
  - (b) A keen understanding of community development and crime prevention programmes in Jamaica and experience in mainstreaming gender equality in development projects would be an asset.
- 4. The qualifications and experience of any person subsequently assigned to the position of PC shall be acceptable to CDB.

#### **REPORT FORMAT FOR BASELINE RESULTS**

- 1. Results of a baseline assessment should be interpreted and narrated in standard, easy-to-read report formats. These should enable all stakeholders and other users to understand the current situation of the selected performance indicators and clarify subtleties which cannot be explained quantitatively. The following is the proposed Outline of the Baseline Report:
  - (a) Title Page: The report should have the project title, and the title page should include the names of the assessment team and the dates on which the assessment was carried out.
  - (b) Acronyms: Acronyms used in the text should be spelled out here for easy reference.
  - (c) Executive Summary: The Executive Summary should be a brief presentation on the project focus, the context under which the baseline assessment was done, general findings and general conclusions.
  - (d) Table of Contents: In the Table of Contents, the section headings should follow the numbering format suggested in these guidelines but this can be adapted where necessary.
  - (e) Introduction and Background: This section should include some background information on the project, objectives, and an overview of the expected results, the extent of its activities, its geographic scope, and the situation in which it operates. Include a brief on the project results and performance indicators that have been assessed. Issues to include are the context in which the assessment is conducted (for example, socioeconomic, physical, cultural, political, *etc.* which might have bearing on expected results), implementing partners, and target stakeholder categories. The purpose and objectives of the baseline assessment should be presented and clarified.
  - (f) Methodology: This section should include discussion of the following:
    - (i) the general framework of the assessment;
    - (ii) techniques employed in information gathering;
    - (iii) the participatory methodology(ies) used;
    - (iv) tools used to collect and analyse the data/information;
    - (v) the composition of the assessment team;
    - (vi) the range of stakeholders involved; and
    - (vii) the limitations or constraints in terms of information gathering, the tool or other constraints faced by the evaluation team.
  - (g) Analysis of the findings: This section should include an interpretation of the results within the context in which the assessment was conducted. Key performance indicators should be elaborated in detail clearly indicating the data elements, data source, analytical tools used, the data and interpretation. Identify components which may need further assessment.

- (h) Conclusions: Conclusions sum up the findings of the assessment. They facilitate the formulation of general and specific recommendations for tracking the indicators, modifying and/or developing new performance indicators.
- (i) Annexes/Appendices: This section should include relevant documents, data, tables, assessment ranking, a glossary and other information the assessment team deem necessary. Each Annex/Appendix should be numbered and listed by title in the Table of Contents.

## PROVISIONAL IMPLEMENTATION PLAN

Tas	sk Name	Duration	Start	Finish	Notes	Q4 Q1 Q2 Q3 Q4 Q1 Q2
	onducting Baseline Studies for Seventeen Inner City ommunities - Jamaica	378 days	2016-03-09	2017-08-18		04 01 02 03 04 01 02
2	Approval by CDB's Board of Directors	0 days	2016-03-09	2016-03-09		<u>_</u>
3	Signing of Grant	35 days	2016-03-09	2016-04-26		1 14
	Satisfaction of Conditions Precedent to 1st Disbursement	35 days	2016-03-09	2016-04-26		1 4
5	Procure Consulting Firm by QBS	68 days	2016-04-27	2016-07-29		
23	Consultancy Services	275 days	2016-07-29	2017-08-18	Time after start:	
24	Commence consultancy	0 days	2016-07-29	2016-07-29		re
25	Submit Inception Report	0 days	2016-08-19	2016-08-19	3 weeks	<del> </del>
26	CRP & GOJ review of Inception Report	5 days	2016-08-22	2016-08-26	4 weeks	🍆
27	CDB NO to Inception Report	5 days	2016-08-29	2016-09-02	5 weeks	
28	Submit Progress Report No. 1	0 days	2016-09-30	2016-09-30	9 weeks	<del>                                  </del>
29	CRP & GOJ review of Progress Report No. 1	5 days	2016-10-03	2016-10-07	10 weeks	1   <b>   -</b> -
30	CDB NO to Progress Report No. 1	5 days	2016-10-10	2016-10-14	11 weeks	<b>-</b>
31	Submit Progress Report No. 2	0 days	2016-12-23	2016-12-23	21 weeks	<del>   </del>
32	CRP & GOJ review of Progress Report No. 2	5 days	2016-12-26	2016-12-30	22 weeks	1   4
33	CDB NO to Progress Report No. 2	5 days	2017-01-02	2017-01-06	23 weeks	•
34	Issue Draft Report to Stakeholders	0 days	2017-03-24	2017-03-24	34 weeks	<del>                                  </del>
35	Present Draft Report at Workshop	1 day	2017-04-10	2017-04-10	36 weeks	
36	Submit Draft Final Report	0 days	2017-05-05	2017-05-05	40 weeks	<u>                                  </u>
37	CRP & GOJ review of Draft Final Report	10 days	2017-05-08	2017-05-19	42 weeks	<b> </b> -
38	CDB NO to Draft Final Report	5 days	2017-05-22	2017-05-26	43 weeks	]   <b> </b>
39	Submit Final Report	0 days	2017-08-18	2017-08-18	45 weeks	

# BUDGET (USD)

ITEM	CDB (SDF)	GOJ	TOTAL
CDB:			
Consultancy Services	400,064		400,064
Project Management and Administrative Support		120,500	120,500
Stakeholder Consultations		12,000	12,000
Contingencies	40,006	13,250	53,256
TOTAL COST	440,070	145,750	585,820
Percentage %	75	25	100

#### **PROCUREMENT PLAN**

### I. General

1. **Project Information:** 

Country: Jamaica

Borrower: The Government of Jamaica (GOJ)

Project Name: Conducting Baseline Studies for Seventeen Inner City Communities - Jamaica

Project Implementing Agency: The Planning Institute of Jamaica

2. **Bank's Approval Date of the Procurement Plan**: March 9, 2016

3. **Period Covered By This Procurement Plan:** March 9, 2016 to September 9, 2017

#### II. Consulting Services

1. **Prior Review Threshold:** Procurement decision subject to prior review by the Bank as stated in Appendix 1 to the Guidelines for the Selection and Engagement of Consultants:

		Prior Review	C .
	Selection Method	Threshold	Comments
1.	Quality-Based Selection (QBS)	All	

- 2. **Reference to (if any) Project Operational/Procurement Manual:** CDB Guidelines for Selection and Engagement of Consultants 2011.
- 3. Any Other Special Procurement Arrangements: N/A
- 4. Procurement Packages with Selection Methods and Time Schedule:

1	2	3	4	5	6	7
		Estimated		Review by	Expected	
Ref	Assignment	Cost	Selection	Bank	Proposal	
No.	(Description	(USD)	Method	(Prior/Post)	Submission	Comments
1.	Baseline Survey		QBS	Prior	June 2016	

This information is withheld in accordance with one or more of the exceptions to disclosure under the Bank's Information Disclosure Policy.

# **GENDER MARKER ANALYSIS**

Project Cycle Stage	Criteria	Score
Analysis:		
Introduction/Background/Preparation	Consultations with women/girls/men/boys and relevant gender-related or sector-related public or private organisations have taken place.	0.50
	Social analysis identifies gender issues and priorities.	0.25
Design:		
Project Proposal/Definition/Objective/Description	To address the needs of women/girls and men/boys concrete interventions to reduce existing gender disparities have been designed. Effect on project outcome is direct.	0.50
	Project objective/outcome includes gender equality.	0.50
Implementation:		
Execution	Terms of Reference of project coordinating unit includes responsibility for gender mainstreaming.	0.50
Monitoring and Evaluation:		
Results-Monitoring-Framework (RMF)	Sex-disaggregated data included in the baselines, indicators and targets of the RMF.	0.50
	At least one gender-specific indicator at the outcome and/or output level in the RMF	0.50
Total Score	<u> </u>	3.25

Gender Mainstreamed (GM): the project has the potential to contribute significantly to gender equality

# PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT SUMMARY

Criteria	Score	Justification
Relevance	4	The TA is considered as significant and important by the GOJ as it provides a response to a key commitment of the Government's CRP. It is also in keeping with CDB's Strategic Objectives of promoting broad-based economic growth and social development, and promoting good governance, and Corporate Priorities of strengthening evidenced-based policy making and regional cooperation.
Effectiveness	3	The TA will assist in shaping the future performance and enhance the development effectiveness of community-based intervention in inner city communities. It is expected that the TA will provide greater opportunities for stakeholders to better address the needs of the community through a gender lens.
Efficiency	3	This TA will play a significant role in enhancing the framework for the delivery of interventions in inner-city communities in Jamaica. In the long run, the benefits will accrue to the males, females and children in the target communities.
Sustainability	3	The willingness of GOJ to invest in CRP in order to address crime and violence in at-risk, volatile and poor communities despite difficult fiscal circumstances is a major factor influencing sustainability. The focus on collecting sex-disaggregated data and focusing on risk factors that dispose crime and violence among males and females in order to strengthen the gender-sensitive M&E System, strongly suggests GOJ's intention to use evidence-based decision-making in developing and implementing community initiatives that have the potential to be socially-inclusive and transformative. In addition, the inclusion of key stakeholders in the process of developing, undertaking and implementing the findings of the baseline study will strengthen buy-in and confidence in using the results. The establishment of a robust M&E that utilises empirically-derived data that can provide an evaluation of partners' community interventions will strengthen the case for greater financial and technical support to CRP over the longer term. The recruitment of staff to strengthen the CRP Office demonstrates GOJ's commitment to sustaining the overall programme.
Overall Score	3.25	Satisfactory